



Promoting Safe Migration for the Women of Bangladesh
Project
Funded through the Silk Routes Facility

**End-line Evaluation Report
CARE-Bangladesh
Women and Girls Empowerment Program**

Submitted by

Syeda Rozana Rashid, PhD

Professor, Department of International Relations
University of Dhaka, Bangladesh

Email: srr21rozana@gmail.com, rozana@du.ac.bd

Mobile: +8801820225462

with

S.N. Azad and Jalal Uddin Sikder PhD

5 December 2021

Funded by the European Union



**IMPROVING MIGRATION
MANAGEMENT IN THE SILK ROUTES**

Implemented by



Table of Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	3
<i>List of Figure</i>	4
<i>List of Boxes</i>	4
<i>Abbreviations and Acronyms</i>	5
Executive Summary	7
1. Introduction	15
1.1. Background	15
1.2. Overview of the CARE Safe Migration Project	16
1.3. Purpose and Objectives of Evaluation	16
1.4. Criteria of Evaluation and Key Questions	16
1.5. Organization of the Report	18
2. Evaluation Methodology	18
2.1. Evaluation Design	19
2.2. Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI) and Challenges	19
2.3. Data Collection Methodology	24
2.3.1. Document Review	24
2.3.2. Primary Data Collection	24
2.4. Quality Control and Supervision Mechanism	29
2.5. Limitations	29
3. Findings and Analysis	30
3.1. Relevance	30
3.2. Inclusive Coverage, Gender Mainstreaming and Cross Cutting Issues	35
3.3. Effectiveness	36
3.4. Efficiency	40
3.5. Impact	44
3.6. Sustainability	52
3.7. Coherence and Synergy	54
4. Conclusions	57
4.1. Overall Assessment of the Project	57
4.1.1. Appropriateness of the strategy for achieving the strategic goals	57
4.1.2. Key results contributing to the achievement of project objectives	57
4.1.3. Coherence and Synergy	59
4.1.4. Effectiveness of management	59
4.2 Lessons Learned	60
4.3 Recommendations	60
<i>Annex: End-line Survey Results</i>	61

List of Tables

Table 1: Key Questions under the Evaluation Criteria	17
Table 2: Key indicators for determining results against the project objectives/outcomes	20
Table 3: Location of Survey	25
Table 4: Quantitative Sample Distribution	26
Table 5: Status of Respondents	26
Table 6: Age of Respondents	26
Table 7: Marital Status of the Respondents	27
Table 8: Marital Status of the Respondents	27
Table 9: Whether Respondents make any decision at the household	28
Table 10: Data Collection Tools, Target Groups and Sample Size	28
Table 11: Status of Project Achievements at the Outcome, Output and Activity Levels	38
Table 12: Funds, Expertise and Time Utilized by the Migration Project	43
Table 13: Volume of Participation of Target group (women) in at least one WARBE/CARE program	44
Table 14: Volume of Participation of Target group (women) in WARBE/CARE Trainings and Courtyard Meetings	45
Table 15: Volume of Respondents (women) aware about the basic rights of women and migrant workers	46
Table 16: Response of target group about the usefulness of the project activities to raise their awareness about the rights of women and migrant workers	46
Table 17: Knowledge/ life-skills the respondents obtained from WARBE/CARE Project	46
Table 18: Application of the knowledge / skills gathered from WARBE/CARE training programs	47
Table 19: The impact of project activities over solving a real-life problem of the respondents	47
Table 20: The volume of awareness /training of safe migration and life skills obtained by the respondents	48

Table 21: Volume of respondents received information on health related risks associated with migration (life skill)	48
Table 22: The Potential of Interventions	50
Table 23: Respondents Knowledge about availability of Migration Services in the Community	55
Table 24: Collaborative Initiatives of the Safe Migration Project	55

List of Figure

Figure 1: Sample Size Calculation Formula	25
--------------------------------------------------	----

List of Boxes

Box 1: Judgment Criterion	36
Box 2: KII Responses on the Development of Women’s Awareness about Safe Migration	45
Box 3 : 10 Key Statements made by Local- level FGDs Participants	51

Abbreviations and Acronyms

BAIRA	Bangladesh Association of International Recruiting Agencies
BDT	Bangladeshi Taka
BMET	Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training
BOAF	Bangladesh Ovibashi Adhikar Forum
BOESL	Bangladesh Overseas Employment and Services Limited
CBO	Community Based Organization
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CP	Colombo Process
CWCS	Centre for Women and Children Studies
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DEMO	District Employment & Manpower Offices
DSS	Department of Social Services
EU	European Union
EWOEP	Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment Policy
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
FY	Fiscal Year
GCM	Global Compact for Migration
GFMD	Global Forum on Migration and Development
GEF	Gender Equity Framework
GoB	Government of Bangladesh
ICMPD	International Centre for Migration Policy Development
ICRMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
IDI	In-Depth Interview
ILO	International Labour Organization
IOs	Intergovernmental Organizations
IOM	International Organization for Migration

KII	Key Informant Interview
MoEWOE	Ministry of Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment
NGO	Non-Government Organization
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OEMA	Overseas Employment and Migration Act
OVI	Objectively Verifiable Indicators
PDO	Pre-Decision Orientation
PSHTA	Prevention and Suppression on Human Trafficking Act
RMRRU	Refugee and Migratory Movements Research Unit
SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SOV	Sources of Verification
TOT	Training of Trainers
TTC	Technical Training Center
UAE	United Arab Emirates
UDC	Union Digital Centers
UNO	Upazila Nirbahi Officer
WARBE	Welfare Association for the Rights of Bangladeshi Emigrants
WEWB	Wage Earners Welfare Board

Executive Summary

Over the past few decades, migration beyond the borders has become an important livelihood strategy for Bangladeshi men and women. More than 13 million people have been migrated abroad for mostly low-skilled work between 1976-2021, whereas women comprise around 19% of the total flow. Assuming the importance of the migration sector for the national economy, the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) has adopted various normative and policy measures to encourage safe labour migration for men and women. The 8th Five Year Plan (FY2020-FY2025) among other things has clearly mentioned about promoting migration from poorer areas and encouraging women's participation in the labour force. Human rights and social protection issues of female migrants are also provisioned in the Overseas Employment and Migrants Act (OEMA) in 2013 and upgraded Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment Policy in 2016. Yet, female overseas labour migration from Bangladesh is deeply rooted in poverty, gender discrimination, and restricted livelihood options in rural areas. When women are forced to move or actively choose to migrate, their rights as workers and human beings are not fully guaranteed by national or international legislation. They are commonly exploited by middlemen, agents, and employers at home and abroad due to their lack of understanding of rights and entitlements to defend themselves as well as due to the lack of proper service provisions in the sub-districts. The prevailing societal standards also pose a complex set of vulnerabilities for returnee women workers.

In the above background, CARE Bangladesh with its implementing partner WARBE-DF, has implemented a project titled *Promoting Safe Migration for the Women of Bangladesh* (Hereafter referred to as the Project or CARE Project) in two Upazilas (Keraniganj and Nawabganj) under Dhaka district. This project is funded through the Silk Routes Facility- a component of the larger project-*Improving Migration Management in the Silk Routes Countries* funded by the European Union and implemented by ICMPD. The aim of the CARE Project was to promote safe and planned migration particularly for women as a contribution to Sustainable Development Goals 5 and 8, as well as to ensure that women's vulnerability and exploitation is reduced throughout the migration cycle, in line with the relevant objective of the Global Compact for Migration. It had two specific objectives:

1. To enhance the capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers;
2. To empower women in rural communities so that they can make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services.

This is the report of the end-line evaluation of the CARE Project carried out on the basis of a mixed method study comprising document review, survey of 228 women beneficiaries, 25 key informant interviews (KIIs), 5 focus group discussions (FGDs) and 5 in-depth interviews (IDIs) with the stakeholders and implementing organizations. The report is prepared with objectives:

O1: to measure the outcomes and impact of the project against the targeted results and compare to the baseline.

O2: to assess - achievements and results, weaknesses and strengths of the project and document evidence to inform future initiatives of this kind.

O3: to evaluate the Project based standard criteria.

The evaluation has been conducted in line with CARE’s Gender Equity Framework (GEF) for women’s empowerment through agency, structure and relations. In accordance with international standards, in particular the recently updated OECD/DAC criteria, the evaluation team followed the seven evaluation criteria, i.e. relevance, gender mainstreaming and inclusiveness, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability and coherence and synergies.

Major Findings

The outcomes and impact of the project against the targeted results

	Intervention logic	Indicators	End-line Evaluation Results
Overall Objective	To promote safe and planned migration particularly for women as a contribution to Sustainable Development Goals 5 and 8	# of actions on safe migration based on global commitments implemented by key government institutions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Civil Society Organisation WARBE-DF Bangladesh actively collaborated with the Government of Bangladesh to discuss common issues regarding safe female migration in line with the ILO Convention, CEDAW, GFMD, GCM, and UN High-Level Dialogues. - With the Support of WARBE-DF, the South Asian parliamentarians from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Nepal, and India formed the South Asian Parliamentary Caucus, committed to raise migration concerns in national legislatures and to monitor talks and deliberations in SAARC, the Colombo Process, and the Abu Dhabi Dialogue. - The GoB expressed a desire for a specific institutional structure to implement female migration rights at the Upazila level.
		% of aspirant women who have access to safe migration services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - According to the end line survey 85% of aspirant women had access to safe migration services
Specific Objective 1: Outcome 1	Oc 1 Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive	Oc 1.1 # of recommendations from advocacy initiatives on ILO Convention/GCM/CEDAW and studies recognized by policy makers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Meetings on the International Labour Organization's (ILO) Convention C189 and the Global Compact on Migration (GCM) was held to determine the severity of abuse and exploitation of migrant workers; that a technical analysis and assessment be conducted to determine whether the articles of C189 are feasible to implement; and that the support service mechanism be improved.

	migration for decent job placement of women workers		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Officials from the GoB expressed their willingness to implement comprehensive training programmes for female migrants. - Advocacy sessions for policy changes or enhancements for women who have been victims of migration were undertaken at the Upazila level.
		Oc 1.2 # of new measures implemented by targeted institutions on safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration and to reduce exploitation of women by middlemen	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training curriculum for addressing women and gender issues were reviewed and completed to be incorporated in government's TTC training. - Through curriculum reform, the BMET and TTCs have demonstrated their desire to address women and gender concerns noted by experts.
<p style="text-align: center;">Specific Objective 2: Outcome 2</p>	Oc 2 Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services	Oc 2.1 # and type of actions implemented by women champions that aim to reduce vulnerability and increase resilience of women migrant workers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Completed the safe migration information packages, learning materials (flip charts) for the courtyard meeting's content; created and distributed the booklet and information board on safe migration - Life Skills-based pre-decision orientation on safe migration, risk and vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights and legal support and communication and training were organised. - Brought services and information to women's doorsteps through Union Digital Centres and Community Based Organizations. - An animated docu-movie was exhibited at all Project trainings in Keraniganj and Nawabganj, for bringing attention to the crucial problem of migration and exploitation by middlemen. - 32 returnees and one aspirant migrant were referred to BMET, WARBE's grievance receiving cell,

			and the government's financial aid programme by women information champions and UDC entrepreneurs.
		- Oc 2.2 # and % of aspirant women in the target area who received women-specific services by Community Based Organizations and Local Government Institutions for planned and safe migration	- According to the end-line survey, around 83% of aspirant migrant women in the project area had knowledge about women and migrants' rights, - around 18% received services from the UDC corners
		- Oc 2.3 # and % of women trained by women champions, CBOs and Local Institutions who underwent planned, safe and orderly migration	More than 88% of survey participants received training.

The Strengths and Weaknesses of the Project

The Project had the following strengths:

- The Project was efficient and effective in implementing a wide variety of interventions at the local and national level. It was designed to bring a holistic change at all levels commensurate with the local, national, regional and global initiatives to ensure safe migration for women.
 - Implementing organizations have capitalized on their resources in advocacy and policy networks at the national level to ensure effective and efficient outcomes. WARBE used its advocacy network and civil society platform, i.e. BOAF (A Trade Union and Civil Society Organisation Platform on Migration) and the Parliamentary Caucus Committee for efficiently holding the national and local level programmes. WARBE-DF also drew on its experiences of CBO formation in its other project areas.
 - The Project was run by a skilled and experienced team who was able to run it in an efficient way considering quality of programme delivery and partnership management.

The Project had the following weaknesses:

- The time line set for achieving the Project's objectives were found to be inadequate compared to the expected results. The Project got a lifespan of 18 months (November 2019 to September 2021), and two no-cost extensions for 3 months and 2 months respectively due to disruption of project activities during the Covid-19 pandemic. The project was severely impacted by three nationwide lockdowns imposed by the government due to the COVID-19 pandemic. To accomplish remaining work (6 months' work) and to finish unspent budget, WARBE-DF recruited two field assistants. To adjust with the situation the Project conducted a number of activities online including the development of training modules and studies and organised annual dialogues, national level advocacy meetings, advocacy meetings on ILO C189, advocacy meeting with the CEDAW Committee were organized virtually. It revised

the community level activities such as the number of courtyard meetings (from 120 to 75). To meet the targeted beneficiaries from those deducted numbers of court yard meetings, the project also produced and disseminated IEC materials such as leaflets and established information boards at two Upazilla Parishad. Moreover, the project has increased the number of life skills sessions from 20 to 25 to ensure social distancing. CARE and WARBE-DF attempted to increase the efficiency of the training by dividing the trainees in small groups and keeping 3 returnee trainees in each group. The idea behind was implementing a peer learning system. There was, however, no mechanism to monitor the efficiency of this coping strategy. The efficiency of the training was also compromised to some extent by the non-residential nature of the training. An additional round of training was arranged to enhance training qualities.

- o Institutional capacity of some of its stakeholders cum beneficiaries i.e. CBOs, UDCs, Women Champions and local leaders could not be built at a level which may ensure sustainability of the relevant outputs and outcomes after the Project ends. Due to COVID-19 pandemic, CBOs, in particular, were formed at the last stage of the Project to ensure that the CBO members had received training, trust and competency to carry out their activities even when the project is withdrawn from the area. As a result, the Project did not get adequate time for registration and effective functioning of the CBOs. Due to the lockdowns at wake of the pandemic, the implementing organization had to wait for long to organize training and hence they did not get sufficient time to build the confidence and willingness among targeted beneficiaries to form and run a CBO. After the baseline survey, they also had to replace members of a CBO which was formed with members from other unions. Moreover, at least 20 members abdicated their memberships showing reasons like their families changed their mind.

- o It was difficult for the Project to anticipate a non-conventional risk such as the Pandemic since it is not common. As per the original work plan, the project's community level interventions were supposed to start from the beginning of April 2021. However, the GoB announced a nationwide lockdown on 26 March 2020, which, as a "general public holiday". The Project adopted contingency plans to overcome the problem of intermittent activities and outcomes caused by the series of lockdowns and social distancing factors. During the first lockdown, CARE together with its partner WARBE DF re-focused attention to all preparatory work that can be conducted remotely without travel involved. These desk-based activities included the drafting of the content of guidelines and modules for courtyard and community meetings, CBO formation guidelines and training content for capacity building. It also implemented state and stakeholder level activities through virtual platforms. Finally, considering the three times lockdown, the project adopted alternative plans for some of the community level activities mentioned above.

- o The Project conducted a baseline survey. A MEAL Plan was also developed to strengthen its monitoring system. Monthly targets and formats for filling out the activities were provided by WARBE-DF to the field officers. The study could not however measure the qualitative impacts and outcome of the Project from the available data.

Overall evaluation of the Project based on selected evaluation criteria

The following are the primary findings in connection to the six evaluation areas specified in the Terms of Reference.

Relevance: The project "Promoting Safe Migration for Bangladeshi Women" is extremely relevant to the Government of Bangladesh's (GoB) migration policies and practices (e.g., Vision 2021, 6th, 7th, and 8th Year Plans) for planning and regulating the migration sector, preventing irregular migration, and ensuring migrant protection and welfare, among other things. They also align with the 2030 agenda and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 5,8 and 10.7, which aim to ensure that national sustainable development policies are coherent and that national responses to the Agenda's overall implementation are feasible and ambitious, based on current planning instruments. The project also complies with the Government of Bangladesh's commitment to a number of international instruments and regional procedures. For example, the South Asian Parliamentary Caucus was established in December 2015, with South Asian parliamentarians from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Nepal, and India agreeing to raise migration issues in national parliaments and to monitor SAARC, the Colombo Process, and the Abu Dhabi Dialogue discussions and deliberations. Both receiving and sending countries' governments are beginning to recognise WARBE-DF's importance in identifying policy and program deficiencies and making recommendations for practical procedures to fix such gaps. The Project's goals and design reflect CARE's global gender equality and women's empowerment approach to implementing the UN 2030 Agenda, with a focus on managing migration at the individual level, through social and host community support for women aspirant migrants, as well as at the "structural" level, which includes policies and their successful implementation.

Effectiveness: The project has met more than 92 percent of its objectives, such as drafting the text of the safe migration information packages, learning materials (flip charts) for the courtyard meeting's topic, and a pamphlet and information board on safe migration distributed by project implementing partner WARBE-DF. It developed successful and amicable collaborations with national, district, and local level institutions and individuals for the Project's implementation. The Project started revising the government's training curriculum for dealing with women and gender issues in April 2021, and it concluded in August 2021 with a redesigned domestic worker curriculum that would be incorporated into TTC training. The project also is successful in delivering services to people's homes. Returning and aspirant migrants are referred to BMET, WARBE's grievance receiving cell, and the government's complaint mechanism.

Efficiency: The Project was carried out in an efficient way considering the number of programme delivery and partnership management, though the quality of the outputs could have been better. The management faced challenges to adjust activities with the outbreak of the pandemic. During the COVID-19 period, however, WARBE-DF and CARE used to communicate their work plans and discuss their strategic interventions on a regular basis. WARBE used its lobbying network and civil society platforms to ensure that the programs were delivered efficiently. With the Parliamentary Caucus Committee, for example, it had successfully invested in its resources and networks. WARBE-DF also drew on its previous CBO creation expertise in other projects. However, the evaluation concludes that monitoring could be enhanced. The existing system is based on data stored by CARE in Excel files from from implementing partner's monthly progress reports and regular field inspections by the CARE Team; the implementing partner has collected data in MS Word using several templates that do not provide a clear picture of the results accomplished.

Gender Mainstreaming and Inclusive Coverage: The Project was gender-sensitive and targeted primarily to potential women migrants. CARE Bangladesh develops programme using a contextual analysis, employing the Gender Equality Framework (GEF), and integrates the resulting knowledge into this project across various sectors. CARE's women's empowerment impact statement has selected three

domains of change such as: (i) exercise of greater choice of decisions affecting women's lives, (ii) reduced violence against women, and (iii) strong social movements built on women's solidarity and participation of men. CARE's Gender Equality Framework (GEF) has identified three key levers for women's empowerment, which include agency that denotes women's own aspirations and capabilities such as decision-making, knowledge and skills; , structures that influences or conditions women's choices and chances and the relationships through which women negotiate their rights and needs with other social actors including men. The Safe Migration Project was undertaken under CARE's GEF and women's empowerment impact framework and hence potential, aspirant and returnee women migrants were the primary target and beneficiary of the project. Given its migration focus, minorities and disabled women remained outside the purview of the Project though all targeted populations of the Project were benefitted equitably from the interventions. In the same logic and also since the areas do not belong to the ecologically most vulnerable regions of Bangladesh, specific cross-cutting issues, such as environmental and climate change affected women were not brought within the purview of the project. The project could however have benefited more by including men and women family members of the aspirant migrant households and also by including cross-section of women i.e. students, working women, women entrepreneur and others i.e. religious leaders to ensure more inclusiveness and achieve larger response.

Impact: The Project had observed significant impacts on the stakeholders and beneficiaries. Women were more informed about migration than they were during the baseline survey and, thereby, more empowered to make their decisions about migrating abroad for work. The Project contributed to raising awareness among migrant women and enhancing the life-skills of female migrant workers. Local leaders and service providers were informed about migration which made them more committed to the issues of women migration. The Project contributed to changing the mindset of the community regarding the negative impact of female migration. The Project was also beneficial for the returnee migrants. The problems related to intermediaries were addressed to a large extent by the Project as it developed women's access to alternative sources of information, i.e. CBOs, UDC, DEMO and Women Champions.

Sustainability: The Project was developed and implemented sustainably. National and local government officials, lawmakers and formal and informal local actors/leaders involved in project activities have expressed their willingness to sustain the outputs. The Project has conducted advocacy meetings with relevant stakeholders i.e. CEDAW Committee, law makers, CSO activists and practitioners on ILO Convention C 189 and GCM. It also shared its knowledge products i.e. the women migrants' case studies and research report on female migration in South Asia with relevant stakeholders. However, the two sustainability components of the project i.e. CBOs and UDCs need incentives for sustenance. The efficacy and feasibility of CBOs remained uncertain as their capacity could not be built or tested during the Project period.

Coherence & Synergies: The Project was well aligned with the national and global initiatives regarding safe female labour migration. It has successfully brought together a wide variety of stakeholders representing the government, the civil society and non-profit organizations including BMET, TTC, DEMO, UNO, UP Chairmen, Members, BOAF and CWCS. Yet, synergies were rarely built with local activities implemented by other NGOs, IOs, government, and with local initiatives. Whether they had prior knowledge of any other programme on migration a good 52 per cent of people answered in affirmative.

Lessons Learned

Evidently, the Project needs to continue in some form to get to the point of sustainability and properly measurable impact. No 18-month programme can become successful on its own, if not complemented by simultaneous or follow up programmes to carry forward or bring out a compound positive result. The evaluation study found the following key lessons learned from the Project:

Project Design and Management

- The CARE Safe Migration Project allowed inadequate time to receive sustained results and was left ‘prematurely’. Any future project with holistic and rights and results based approaches should have a length of 5 years for sustained results as well as to observe the social changes and transformation through project interventions. Short-term (2 years or less) projects such as the CARE Project should be designed with limited and focused outputs.
- Projects such as this require continuous follow up and monitoring for persistent and quality results. Appropriate monitoring frameworks for all outputs and stakeholders should be in place before launching the project.
- The Project should have adequate flexibility to upgrade the strategy and change selective components and criteria for mitigating unanticipated risks. Future projects should consider non-conventional sources of threats and risks such as a pandemic or environmental disaster which can substantially impact project results and outcomes.

Project Implementation and Sustainability

- Employing local people as Project Staff is beneficial for implementation and sustainability of projects such as this since local people remain in the area even after withdrawal of the project funding and activities and often work as a conduit of information for the community.
- For better implementation, family members of women migrants should be included in the project. Religious and educational institutions should be engaged in female migration related projects to address inclusivity and cross-cutting issues. Female students, working women, small scale entrepreneurs should also be included as beneficiaries.
- The duration of the training should be longer to connect the participants with the content and to ensure trainees’ engagement and participation in the programme. From an implementation point of view, residential training yields more effectiveness than non-residential ones.
- Dialogues regarding normative framework and protection mechanisms should be focused on a single topic and allow more time for discussion. Follow up activities should be planned to get results out of such advocacy activities.
- despite having huge potential in terms of information delivery and other services to aspirant women migrants, women champions and UDCs were left without any incentives to carry on their activities. Future projects should consider this for sustained results.
- Women CBOs were an important outcome of CARE Project having the most sustainability potential. In future initiatives such as this should be allowed with sufficient time for formation, capacity building and functioning. At least one follow up activity (i.e. monthly meeting) or self-sustaining /income generating activities should be planned and designed for their sustenance. Annual activity plan could have been developed for the CBOs before the end of the project. A win-win situation can help sustain them and the Project.
- To avoid duplication of work, CSOs/NGOs work should have synergy and coherence. Projects of various organizations should not concentrate in one area. They should cover as many migrant communities as possible through holistic approaches and sustained and coherent results.

Policy Implications

- The Project is replicable in other areas. Similar projects should be implemented in other female migration-intensive districts using the similar design for an extended period of time since the GoB is not fully capable of taking the migrant information and services at women's door steps.
- Future such projects may include new components such as returnee reintegration, skills training and reskilling for remigration and entrepreneurship development for the returnee women.
- While changing policy and establishing normative framework is an indispensable part of such a project design, these can be made more effective by focusing on specific issues to be pursued continuously.

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

Over the past few decades, migration beyond the borders has become an important livelihood strategy for Bangladeshi men and women. More than 13 million people have been migrated abroad for mostly low-skilled work between 1976-2021, whereas women comprise around 19% of the total flow. The Gulf States and other Arab countries have become the major draws for Bangladeshi female migrant workers. Saudi Arabia was the single most important destination for Bangladeshi female migrant workers, receiving 59.71 per cent of the total of female migrant workers in 2019. Jordan (18.81 per cent) receives the second largest percentage of female migrant workers, followed by Oman (11.67 per cent), Qatar (3.57 per cent), United Arab Emirates (UAE) (2.37 per cent), Lebanon (1.54 per cent) and Mauritius (1.06 per cent).¹

Assuming the importance of the migration sector for the national economy, the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) encourages female migration. It has adopted various normative and policy frameworks in this regard. The 8th Five Year Plan (FY2020-FY2025) among other things has clearly mentioned about promoting migration from poorer areas and encouraging women's participation in the labour force. Human rights and social protection issues of female migrants are also provisioned in the Overseas Employment and Migrants Act (OEMA) in 2013 and upgraded Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment Policy in 2016.

Yet, female overseas labour migration from Bangladesh is deeply rooted in poverty, gender discrimination, and restricted livelihood options in rural areas. When women are forced to move or actively choose to migrate, their rights as workers and human beings are not fully guaranteed by national or international legislation. They are commonly exploited by middlemen, agents, and employers at home and abroad due to their lack of understanding of rights and entitlements to defend themselves as well as due to the lack of proper service provisions in the sub-districts. The prevailing societal standards also pose a complex set of vulnerabilities for returnee women workers.

It is in this backdrop that the CARE and its partner organisation WARBE-DF have implemented a project titled "Promoting Safe Migration for Bangladeshi Women" (hereafter mentioned as 'CARE Project' or 'the Project') under the EU funded ICMPD project of "Improving Migration Management in Silk Routes Countries". The goal of the initiative was to promote responsible, safe, and orderly migration, which is a

¹ BMET, Statistics, <http://www.old.bmet.gov.bd/BMET/stattisticalDataAction>, Accessed on 16 September 2021.

goal set forth in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The project is also aligned with the SDGs target for the implementation of well-planned and managed migration policies.

1.2 Overview of the CARE Safe Migration Project

The CARE Project's overarching goal was to promote safe and planned migration, particularly for women, as a means of achieving Sustainable Development Goals 5 and 8, and to reduce women's vulnerability and exploitation throughout the migration cycle. It had too specific goals too. These are:

- i. To enhance the capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers.
- ii. To empower women in rural communities so that they can make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services.

1.3 Purpose and Objectives of Evaluation

As the project has come to an end, it needs an end-line evaluation for impact assessment and future references. This is the report of the end-line evaluation of the CARE Project. It is prepared with the following objectives:

- O1:** Measure the outcomes and impact of the project against the targeted results and compared to the baseline.
- O2:** Assess the achievements and results, weaknesses and strengths of the project and document evidence to inform future initiatives of this kind.
- O3:** Evaluate the Project based on standard practices including relevance, coherence and synergies, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability and gender mainstreaming and cross-cutting issues.

As per the ToR, this evaluation has been conducted in line with CARE's Gender Equity Framework (GEF) for women's empowerment through agency, structure and relations will need to be considered and be reflected in the evaluation.

1.4 Criteria of Evaluation and Key Questions

In accordance with international standards, in particular the recently updated OECD/DAC criteria, the evaluation team will follow the six DAC evaluation criteria, i.e. **relevance, coherence and inclusive coverage, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability**, as well as the specific criteria of **gender mainstreaming and cross-cutting issues**. The meaning and substance of each component are described below:

- o **Relevance:** the extent to which the intervention objectives and design responded to beneficiaries' and target groups' needs.
- o **Inclusive Coverage:** whether all targeted populations are benefitting equally from the intervention as it was originally planned.
- o **Gender mainstreaming & Cross-cutting issues:** the extent to which the project has succeeded in including a gender and COVID-19 prevention initiative during implementation.

- o **Effectiveness:** the extent to which the Project’s objectives and results were met considering the Project’s result chain and indicators, baseline and target figures.
- o **Efficiency:** whether the project was run in an efficient way considering the management set-up and partnership between CARE and WARBE DF on the ground to identify strengths and opportunities of the overall implementation process, management, communication and collaboration so far.
- o **Impact:** evidence of expected and unexpected, positive and negative, change against the Project's objectives and identify lessons learned and powerful intervention to leverage for future initiative.
- o **Sustainability:** the extent to which the net benefits of the intervention continue, or are likely to continue.
- o **Coherence & Synergies:** the compatibility of the intervention with other similar interventions in the country. Evaluate the extent to which synergies with other partners (i.e. NGOs, IOs, government) and local actions were used and if those can be extended for future initiatives.
- o **Lessons Learned & Recommendations:** key lessons learned and recommendations for future similar initiatives/projects to ensure the above objectives are met to the best extend possible.

Based on the objectives and ToR, the specific key questions that were asked under the components are:

Table 1: Key Questions under the Evaluation Criteria

Relevance	<input type="checkbox"/> Was the project designed in a way that is relevant to reach its goals and needs of the target beneficiaries? <input type="checkbox"/> Are there any gaps in the design, e.g. also in the project’s risk assessment to be addressed for future similar initiatives/projects?
Inclusive Coverage:	<input type="checkbox"/> Have all the targeted populations benefitted equitably (fairly) from the intervention? Where? How? <input type="checkbox"/> Were any subgroups left behind? <input type="checkbox"/> How could the activities be modified to improve their acceptability of targeted communities in future similar initiatives?
Gender mainstreaming & Cross-cutting issues:	<input type="checkbox"/> To which extent did the project succeed in including a gender perspective? <input type="checkbox"/> How effective are program design and implementation mechanisms in addressing the cross-cutting issues of gender, governance and COVID-19 prevention initiative during implementation?
Effectiveness	<input type="checkbox"/> To which degree did the activities meet the objectives and results set out in the project as outlined in the logical framework, measured against baseline and target figures? <input type="checkbox"/> Are the result indicators and their means of verification adequate?
Efficiency:	<input type="checkbox"/> Was the project run in an efficient way considering the quality of program delivery and partnership management (roles of CARE and WARBE DF)?

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> What are the strengths and opportunities to the overall implementation process, management, communication and collaboration? <input type="checkbox"/> What factors appear to promote or challenge the activity operations or effective collaboration and cooperation among the various stakeholders? <input type="checkbox"/> Is a sufficient communication system in place to capture and share lessons learned for project adaptations?
Impact:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> What evidences of changes-expected and unexpected, positive and negative-do community members and other stakeholders associate with the project's interventions? <input type="checkbox"/> What factors appear to promote and deter these changes? <input type="checkbox"/> Which interventions appear to have more or less potential to influence knowledge or behaviours?
Sustainability:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Has the project developed and implemented sustainability? <input type="checkbox"/> To what extent were local government officials, formal and informal local actors/leaders involved in project activities and included in ongoing program discussions? <input type="checkbox"/> Are there proper identification of roles on who should be doing what after the project's end?
Coherence & Synergies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> To which extent were synergies used or built with other activities implemented by other NGOs, IOs, government, and with local initiatives? <input type="checkbox"/> Have the interventions supported (or undermined) other interventions, policies, etc.?
Lessons Learned	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Based on the above questions, what are key lessons learned and recommendations for taking future such initiatives/projects?

1.5. Organization of the Report

The remainder of the report is organized in five sections. The next section has detailed out the methodologies used for the end-line evaluation. In the subsequent section, the report describes findings and analyses on the basis of aforementioned evaluation criteria. The last section offers some concluding observations based on the findings and provides a brief note on the key lessons learned from the Project.

2. Evaluation Methodology

This chapter describes the design and methodology of the end-line evaluation of the Project. In doing so, it describes the design, objectively verifiable indicators, data collection methods and the strategies of maintaining the quality of data and information.

2.1 Evaluation Design

The end-line evaluation has been conducted in consideration of the European Commission Guidelines for Evaluations which, among other important features, suggest different tools to be used. It follows OECD/DAC evaluation quality which ensures that the assignment is completed in accordance with professional norms such as impartiality, integrity, honesty, and transparency. The team reviewed CARE Project as well as projects from other development partners and used the essential concepts outlined in the above-mentioned evaluation criteria.

The evaluation has incorporated gender and human rights principles, as well as essential stakeholder participation and input to the extent practicable. Both qualitative and quantitative data were generated and analysed for the evaluation to produce credible information about the extent of results and benefits of support for specific groups of stakeholders. Quantitative data was desegregated based on age, gender, marginalized and vulnerable groups, which was useful for the evaluation.

The following 5 strategies have been employed to accomplish the evaluation:

- 1 The organization of the evaluation, notably the selection and definition of Evaluation Questions including the indicative questions mentioned in the Terms of Reference and assessment criteria and objectively verifiable indicators used to answer them, determining the methodology to be followed.
- 2 The collection of available quantitative and qualitative data from primary and secondary sources through document research and stakeholders' feedback to enable the Evaluation Questions to be answered.
- 3 The analysis of the data collected to assess the immediate and potential impact of the intervention in the context of key Evaluation Criteria.
- 4 An assessment of the potential sustainability of the activities implemented.
- 5 The analysis of findings to answer the Evaluation Questions and drawing conclusions on the success of the intervention, and drafting recommendations for possible improvements in current and future interventions based on lessons learned.

2.2 Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI) and Challenges

The table below presents a set of important indicators selected by the evaluation team for each result in each of the project objectives/outcomes, as well as major concerns and obstacles to consider during the evaluation.

Table 2: Key indicators for determining results against the project objectives/outcomes

Result of Objectives/Outcomes	Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI) and Sources of Verification (SOV)	Issues to be looked at
<p>Overall Objective: To promote safe and planned migration particularly for women as a contribution to Sustainable Development Goals 5 and 8</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> of actions on safe migration based on global commitments implemented by key government institutions</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> % of aspirant women who have access to safe migration services</p>		
<p>Specific Objective/Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers</p>		
<p>Oc 1.1: of recommendations from advocacy initiatives on ILO Convention/GCM /CEDAW and studies recognized by policy makers.</p> <p>Oc 1.2: of new measures implemented by targeted institutions on safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration and to reduce exploitation of women by middlemen.</p>	<p>Publication and implementation of new policy with clearly defined implementation plans (legal publications)</p> <p>Evidence from the needs assessment and other analyses on the situation in Bangladesh.</p> <p>The activities and design of the project are in line.</p> <p>Review of migration laws, policies and regulations (report) – proposal for amendments (report) – adoption of a new legal framework (official publications).</p> <p>The SDGs and the Agenda 2030.</p> <p>The Global Compact for Migration.</p>	<p>Status of implementation of the policy – ownership of the government – human and financial resources to implement the policy.</p> <p>Improvements resulting from a better coordination among agencies</p> <p>Further initiatives taken by implementation agencies after project completion</p>
<p>Specific Objective/Outcome 2: Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services</p>		
<p>Oc 2.1: and type of actions implemented by women champions that aim to reduce vulnerability and increase resilience of women migrant workers.</p>	<p>Project documentation, report, training, awareness and services delivered</p>	<p>Status of implementation of the activities by women champions</p>

<p>Oc 2.2: and % of aspirant women in the target area who received women-specific services by Community Based Organizations and Local Government Institutions for planned and safe migration.</p> <p>Oc 2.3: and % of women trained by women champions, CBOs and Local Institutions who underwent planned, safe and orderly migration.</p>	<p>Current situation of beneficiaries and satisfaction levels.</p> <p>Quality of interventions.</p> <p>Increased number of beneficiaries which attended trainings/awareness programmes and received services.</p> <p>Concrete examples of enhanced capacity of beneficiaries (interviews to determine participation and actual use made of information and services provided)</p> <p>Project core documents with case studies, Survey reports, Yearly Evaluation report, , videos, awareness and services delivered (interviews with project officers to establish participation in training/awareness/services and results)</p> <p>Training manuals and results</p> <p>Number and disaggregated data of those who have attended awareness raising and information activities.</p> <p>Quality and quantity of partners to the project.</p> <p>Degree of involvement and coverage.</p>	<p>Improvements resulting from empowerment of women to make informed choices</p> <p>Further initiatives to provide women specific services in project areas</p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

	Number and quality of common actions and interventions.	
Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration		
Op 1.1 # of information materials on safe migration and government services disseminated	Existence of information materials and services	Efficiency improvement.
Op 1.2 # of revised curriculum for domestic workers to be imparted by BMET	Numbers of training provided	Decisions/developments developing from an improved monitoring system.
Op 1.3 # of TOT conducted for BMET and TTC staff	Publications of new courses and revised curriculum by BMET	Actual use made of new competency standards by BMET institutes
Op 1.4 # of recommendations made from advocacy meetings for improving services		
Op 1.5 # of stakeholders mobilised through advocacy activities	Existence of a curriculum on development of competency standards and national TVET qualifications (official publications)	Actual use of handbook and implementation of revised curriculum
Op 1.6 # of annual dialogues sessions/meetings organized between aspirant migrant women and returnees	Relevance of these standards in the view of stakeholders, BMET institutes (interviews)	
	Existence of an ToT manual and operational handbook for BMET institutions	
	Surveys and interviews with trainers and staffs to determine the quality of trainings and services	
	Numbers of participants attended dialogues, sessions, meetings and seminars.	

Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments		
<p>Op 2.1 # of key recommendations placed with CEDAW committee in Bangladesh for reflection in Bangladesh Shadow Report</p> <p>Op 2.2 # of dialogues with key civil society actors and policy makers on C189 and GCM</p> <p>Op 2.3 # of case story based books published</p> <p>Op 2.4 # of desk studies conducted on comparative scenario of female migrant workers in South Asia region - Op 2.5 # of round-table dialogues on key issues from case-story book and study findings</p>	<p>Review of project activities reports and publications including articles and policy briefs etc.</p> <p>Existence of official publications</p> <p>Concrete evidence of enhanced capacity and knowledge (interviews with different policy makers and civil society)</p>	<p>Improvements resulting from an improved environment</p> <p>Further initiatives taken by policy makers and civil after completion of the project.</p>
Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access to information on safe migration and decent work		
<p>Op 3.1 # of community meetings conducted at union level for community mobilization</p> <p>Op 3.2 # of women champions capacitated on disseminating information on safe migration</p> <p>Op 3.3 # of women trained at union level on life skills based pre-decision</p> <p>Op 3.4 # of women reached at court yard meetings at village level on safe migration and decent work</p> <p>Op 3.5 # of women watching the video documentary in targeted locations</p>	<p>Number of training provided in the community level</p> <p>Increased attendance of women participants</p> <p>Increased access of information (interviews with beneficiaries)</p> <p>Enhanced capacity of beneficiaries (interviews with beneficiaries)</p> <p>Project core documents with case studies, survey reports, yearly evaluation report, , videos, awareness and services delivered</p>	<p>Number of opportunities actually taken by women</p> <p>Increased proportion of skilled labour among departing migrants</p>
Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centers have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level		
Op 4.1 # of safe migration corners established at Union Digital	Numbers of centres/corners establishes	Status of implementation

<p>Centres/Union Parishad Op 4.2 # of UDC entrepreneurs trained</p> <p>Op 4.3 # of CBOs formed and functionalized</p> <p>Op 4.4 # of CBO members trained on migration and gender</p> <p>Op 4.5 # and types of actions by UP Secretary and UDC entrepreneurs to facilitate safe migration for women</p> <p>Op 4.6 # and types of referral services to aspirant women facilitated by CBOs and UDCs</p>	<p>Total numbers of services provided and quality of services (interviews with staffs and beneficiaries)</p> <p>Project activity reports and mid-term evaluation reports.</p> <p>Successful rate of services including referral system</p> <p>Project core documents with case studies, Survey reports, Yearly Evaluation report, , videos, awareness and services delivered</p>	<p>Improvements resulting from activities of UDCs and CBOs</p> <p>Further initiatives taken by UDC and CBOs after project completion</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

2.3 Data Collection Methodology

A mixed methodology was followed for the collection of data for the End-line Evaluation including review of documents and literature, survey of the beneficiaries and Focus Group Discussion (FGD) and interview with key informants. These are discussed below:

2.3.1 Document Review

The review and analysis of important papers were part of the desk phase, which assisted the evaluation team in understanding the project context, as well as the formal structure of implementation and coordination processes, and the project's stated objectives. Documents include past evaluations/studies and progress reports of implementation, reports, relevant strategic/policy documents, the project planning documents (Financing agreement, Work Plans, Logical Framework, management/implementation contract, Manual of operations, etc.).

On reviewing the project documents the team identified information gaps and established the data collection procedures and instruments including assessment questions, judgment criteria, and indicators. The work plan was also finalized at this stage in discussion with CARE and WARBE-DF.

2.3.2 Primary Data Collection

The study employed four different tools for primary data collection i.e. survey, Key Informant Interviews (KII), Focus Group Discussions (FGD) and In-depth Interviews (IDIs).

i. Survey: Primary data was collected through a structured questionnaire-based survey of 228 beneficiaries in the field. To determine a representative sample size for considering the beneficiary population size 3000, the study calculated the sample size as 341 as per the following formula: So, the total sample size would be 341. In order to align with the baseline, however, the study decided to lower the sample size up to 220. To avoid risk, a total of 228 beneficiaries were finally surveyed.

Figure 1: Sample Size Calculation Formula

n = Error! Filename not specified.)	n= Sample Size Z=1.96 (for 95% confidence level) e=0.05 p=0.5 N=Population size
-------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

The survey was carried out in Keraniganj and Nawabganj upazilas under Dhaka district. From each upazila, the study selected 3 unions where the Project was implemented. Thus the survey covered a total of 6 unions from 2 upazilas (see Table 3):

Table 3: Survey locations

District	Upazila	Unions
Dhaka	Keraniganj	Aganagor
		Konda
		Shuvadda
	Nawabganj	Bakshonagar
		Agla
		Galimpur
Total	2	6

The number of survey participants in each union was as follows:

Table 4: Quantitative Sample Distribution

Upazila	Unions	Number of Respondents
Keraniganj	Aganagor	38
	Konda	39
	Shuvadda	37
Nawabganj	Bakshonagar	37
	Agla	37
	Galimpur	40
Total Respondents		228

Around 75% of the respondents were aspirant migrants who intended to migrate abroad, whereas 11.4% were returnee migrants. The study also interviewed some women (7.5%) who were not thinking about labour migration abroad at the time of interview.

Table 5: Status of Respondents

Types of Respondents	Number	Percentage
Aspirant Migrant	173	75.9
Potential Migrant	12	5.3
Returnee Migrant	26	11.4
Not Interested	17	7.5
Total	228	100.0

Women interviewed for the study belonged to working age-groups starting from 20 to 40 year. The study had quite an equal percentage (25%) of women from three age groups: 20-25, 26-30 and 35-40 year.

Table 6: Age of Respondents

Age-range	Number	Percentage
20-25	59	25.9

26-30	58	25.4
32-35	59	25.9
36-40	51	22.4
Not Answered	1	0.4
Total	228	100.0

Source: Endline Evaluation Survey

Of the total women surveyed, more than 80% were married, 7.5% unmarried and more than 5% were widows.

Table 7: Marital Status of the Respondents

Types of Marital Status	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Married	192	84.2
Unmarried	17	7.5
Divorcee	2	0.9
Widow	12	5.3
Other type	3	1.3
Not Answered	2	0.9
Total	228	100.0

Source: Endline Evaluation Survey

An overwhelming majority of 28.5% respondents had primary levels of education followed by 25.9% who attended the high school (class VI to VIII) whereas 18% of the respondents attended school up to Class IX and X. A very small percentage of 5.7% respondents attended class XII.

Table 8: Educational Status of the Respondents

Education Levels of Respondents	Number	Percentage
---------------------------------	--------	------------

Lower than Class Five	65	28.5
Up to Class Five	49	21.5
From Class Six to Class Eight	59	25.9
From Class Nine to Class Ten	41	18.0
Higher Secondary	13	5.7
Not Answered	1	0.4
Total	228	100.0

Source: Endline Evaluation Survey

Around 74% respondents informed that they took part in household decision making. This indicates the extent to which the Project interventions were relevant and useful for the targeted beneficiaries.

Table 9: Respondents decision making at the household

Types of Answer	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Yes	169	74.1
No	57	25.0
Not Answered	2	0.9
Total	228	100.0

Source: Endline Evaluation Survey

ii. KIIs: The Project interviewed a total of 20 key informants belonging to local government, local CSOs, women information champions, UDC entrepreneurs and CBO members. The study also conducted 5 KIIs at the national level government officials, NGOs and CSO representatives involved with the Project indifferent capacities.

Table 10: Data Collection Tools, Target Groups and Sample Size

Tools	Target Group	Sample Size
-------	--------------	-------------

Survey	Beneficiary (WMW)	228
KIIs (National Level)	GOs and CSOs/NGOs	5
KIIs (Local Level)	Women Champions, CBOs, TTCs, UDCs	20
FGDs	Beneficiary and non-beneficiary	5
IDIs	CARE	5
	WARBE (Dhaka and local office)	

iii. FGDs: A total of 5 FGDs were carried out to receive community level feedback. Among these, 2 FGDs with women information champions and local CBO members were conducted in Keraniganj Upazila, and 3 FGDs were conducted with women information champions, local CBO members and UP officials in selected Unions of Nawabganj Upazila.

iv. IDIs: The study carried out 5 in-depth Interviews with CARE and WARBE DF personnel at the Project and Head office. Apart from IDIs regular meeting and contact were maintained with CARE officials at this phase to collect and confirm data and information regarding the Project.

2.4. Quality Control and Supervision Mechanism

The quality of the assignment was controlled and maintained in several ways:

First, the team used rigour in data and information generated through document review, KIIs, IDIs and FGDs. Confidentiality of the respondents was maintained where required.

Second, the team leader was responsible for overall supervision of the work. On top of that, the team applied its internal quality control mechanism through regulation, supervision and monitoring of the work.

Third, the team maintained strong communication with CARE to cross check the validity and reliability of data, information and methods.

2.5 Limitations

The study had the following limitations:

- a. The study was carried out within the pandemic situation and hence had to follow a hybrid method of in-person and virtual interviews for primary data collection. All interviews in the field were in-person whereas national-level key informant interviews were carried out over zoom.
- b. Collecting data at the field level was restricted by the availability of the respondents. Sometimes respondents such as UP chairmen and members and UDC representatives were too busy to spend required time with the interviewees. Follow up interviews with them were taken to fill out the gaps.

3. Findings and Analysis

Based on document review and primary data collected from the field this section presents the findings of the end-line evaluation and analyses them based on the evaluation criteria described in the previous section. These are relevance, inclusiveness and crosscutting issues, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability and synergy.

3.1 RELEVANCE

This section discusses the extent to which the intervention objectives and design responded to beneficiaries' and target groups' needs. It asks two key questions.

Evaluation Questions 1.1: Was the project designed in a way that is relevant to reach its goals and needs of the target beneficiaries?

Judgment Criteria 1.1.1: The project's objectives are in line with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development 5 and 8.

Judgment Criteria 1.1.2: The project's objectives are in line with empowering aspirant women migrants with knowledge, skills and information and access to services which will contribute to the commitment of the Budapest Process and Istanbul Declaration (2013)

The overall objective of Promoting Safe Migration for the Women of Bangladesh is to ensure that women's vulnerability and exploitation are reduced throughout the migration process, and women contribute to Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 5 “education regardless of gender, advancement of equality laws, fairer representation” and Goal 8 “creating jobs for all to improve living standards, providing sustainable economic growth.” Within the general framework of the Agenda 2030 target 10.7 stipulates: “Facilitate orderly, safe, regular, and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well-managed migration and mobility of people.” The Project is well aligned with SGD which strives to ensure that national sustainable development strategies are cohesive and that national responses to the overall implementation of the Agenda are practical and ambitious, based on existing planning instruments.

The Project focuses on important parts of the migration cycle. It focuses on “improving the capacity of targeted government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly, and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers,” as well as “empowering women in rural communities to make informed migration decisions and access services.” It intends to handle the various stages of the migration management process in a comprehensive manner, with a particular focus on

- (i) aspirant women who have access to safe migration and decent work services,
- (ii) enhancing inclusive policies and government migration capacity, and
- (iii) changing behavioural aspects associated with making an informed decision to migrate along safe and regular pathways.

The Project “Promoting Safe Migration for the Women of Bangladesh” is highly relevant to the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) migration policies and practices. In many policy documents, the GoB recognises the contribution of Bangladesh’s international labour migrants to the country’s social and economic growth. One of the Vision 2021’s main goals is to reduce poverty by changing the country’s workforce into more skilled for both domestic and foreign employment, planned migration abroad and prevent irregular migration. The 6th and 7th Five Year Plans (FY2010-FY2020)²³ set out clear policy directions in relation to labour migration, such as encouraging migration from poorer areas, increasing the share of skilled and semi-skilled migrant workers, identifying new international labour markets, regulating the migration sector, and ensuring migrant protection and welfare, boosting current remittance rates; lowering remittances and migration expenses; assisting returning migrant workers through enterprise development programmes and improving access to microfinance. The recent 8th Five Year Plan (2021-25)⁴ set a 10-point agenda for migrant workers' overseas employment and well-being. Six of these are directly related to and important to the project's aims and operations.

The GoB adopted the **Overseas Employment and Migrants Act 2013**⁵ and revised the Expatriate Welfare and **Overseas Employment Policy 2016**. For migrant workers, the government is dedicated to ensuring and establishing a "Rights-based Protection System." Two major provisions under the Act are also the Recruiting Agents' Licensing and Conduct Rules 2019 and the Recruiting Agents' Classification Rule 2020, which monitor and regulate recruiting agencies for overseas migration while also encouraging ethical recruitment practises. While ‘Migrant Smuggling’ is not prohibited by this law, this has largely been covered by the rules being finalized for **the 2012 Prevention and Suppression on Human Trafficking Act (PSHTA) in January 2017**.⁶

² GoB. 2011. ‘Sixth Five Year Plan: 2011-2015: Accelerating Growth, Reducing Poverty’. Dhaka: Ministry of Planning, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/plancomm.portal.gov.bd/files/83300734_9ba4_4a36_baef_d7e83509e556/SFYP-Final-Part-1.pdf

³ GoB. 2016. ‘Sixth Five Year Plan: 2011-2015: Accelerating Growth, Empowering Citizen’. Dhaka: Ministry of Planning, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/plancomm.portal.gov.bd/files/aee61c03_3c11_4e89_9f30_d79639595c67/7th_FYP_18_02_2016.pdf

⁴ GoB. 2020. ‘Sixth Five Year Plan: 2020-2025: Promoting Prosperity and Fostering Inclusiveness’. Dhaka: Ministry of Planning, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/plancomm.portal.gov.bd/files/68e32f08_13b8_4192_ab9b_abd5a0a62a33/2021-02-03-17-04-ec95e78e452a813808a483b3b22e14a1.pdf

⁵ GoB. 2013. ‘Overseas Employment and Migration Act 2013’. Dhaka: Ministry of Expatriate, Welfare and Overseas Employment, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: https://probashi.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/probashi.portal.gov.bd/law/8eca4f96_340e_43ac_8ac3_88b57b12cc76/Overseas%20Employment%20&%20Migrants%20Act%20%202013.pdf

⁶GoB. (2012). 2012 Prevention and Suppression on Human Trafficking Act (PSHTA). Dhaka: Ministry of Law, Government of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: http://bdlaws.minlaw.gov.bd/bangla_pdf_part.php?id=1086

The Government of Bangladesh (GoB) established the Wage Earners Welfare Fund (WEWF) in 1990 under the power of section 19 (1) of the **Emigration Ordinance of 1982** to ensure the welfare of migrants and their family members both overseas and in Bangladesh. The Wage Earners Welfare Board (WEWB) was established as a statutory entity to implement this fund by the **Wage Earners Welfare Board Act 2018**.⁷ The board adheres to the international convention and global legal framework that Bangladesh has ratified in order to defend the rights of all migrant workers and their families by offering financial, legal, and technological assistance.

The Project also complies with GoB's commitment to various international instruments and regional processes. The GoB is a party to the International Convention of the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families (ICRMW) 1990 that provides a useful global legal framework for strengthening inter-state cooperation on migration issues. Bangladesh also has accepted specific obligations at the international level to combat human trafficking such as the Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, 1949; ILO Convention on Forced Labour, 1930 (No. 29); ILO Convention on the Abolition of Forced Labour, 1957 (No.105). The GoB served the Chair of the Colombo Process and is a key player of the Abu Dhabi Dialogue. The GoB also attended the Bali Process in 2017 and highlights the business-government partnership to combat people smuggling, human trafficking and transnational crimes. In 2010, the GoB became an observer state in the Budapest Process. On April 19, 2013, the delegates of the Budapest Process governments signed a "Joint Istanbul Declaration", outlining priority areas for asylum and migration cooperation. The GoB is constantly working to defend the rights of all migrants, regardless of their migratory status, and to ensure the safe and regular entry of skilled workers into labour markets under the Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD) and the Global Compact on Migration (GCM). The overarching aim of the Project - to enhance the capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers- matches well with the above initiatives.

In relation to Outcome 1.1 of the Project, the Civil Society Organisations related to WARBE-DF in Bangladesh are actively working with the GoB to discuss the common issues in ILO Convention, CEDAW, GFMD, GCM and UN High-Level Dialogues. For instance, in December 2015 the South Asian Parliamentary Caucus was established with South Asian parliamentarians from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Nepal and India committing to take up issues of migration in national parliaments as well agreeing to monitor the discussions and deliberations in SAARC, Colombo Process and the Abu Dhabi Dialogue. The governments in both the receiving and sending countries are starting to recognise WARBE-DF's role in looking at policy and programme gaps in providing recommendations for practical mechanisms that can address gaps.

The Project's goals are completely consistent with the national and regional approaches, which combine direct support, government capacity building, and information campaigns. While Bangladesh has laws, acts,

⁷ GoB. 'Wage Earners Welfare Board Act 2018'. Dhaka: Ministry of Expatriate, Welfare and Overseas Employment. Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh. Available at: https://probashi.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/probashi.portal.gov.bd/law/d18381cc_4a02_4e84_8045_786d32eb5865/%E0%A6%97%E0%A7%87%E0%A6%9C%E0%A7%87%E0%A6%9F.pdf

and policies that address safe migration, some government offices and implementing agencies are unaware of them, resulting in implementation gaps. This issue was raised by KII respondents as one of the obstacles to ensuring safe migration in Bangladesh. The KIIs also suggest that government agencies are short on manpower, which impedes good service delivery at the community level. Also, because government employees do not work at the community level, aspirant migrants resort to middlemen for information and migration services. To women aspirant migrants, middlemen are more welcomed as they are able to bring services at their doorsteps.

Taking the migration information and services at aspirant migrants' door step is therefore extremely relevant and necessary to reduce sufferings and vulnerabilities of women migrant workers. The survey found that women in the project areas had general low levels of education and hence women are at high risk of being the victim of fraudulence. Also checking information was often not possible for social restriction on women's movements. The Project intended to take the services and information at women's door step through UDC and CBOs- which was considered a solution towards ensuring safe migration.

Dialogues are important for changing policies. From that point of view, the component on dialogue had huge relevance for the project. Earlier also, CSOs played a key role in developing the national legislations and withdraw ban on female migration. There are many issues still prevalent regarding safe migration and hence this component had huge relevance.

Evaluation Question 1.2: Are there any gaps in the design, e.g. also in the project's risk assessment to be addressed for the future similar initiatives/projects?

Judgment Criteria 12.1 - The project is designed following a holistic approach to safe migration.

Judgment Criteria 1.2.2 - The implementing partnership between CARE and WARBE-DF is relevant.

Judgment Criteria 12.3 - The project streamlines gender issues and is gender-sensitive and offers tailored support to women aspirant migrants.

The project is fully applied through the specific objectives and designed actions. The scope of the thematic interventions around safe migration, services to aspirant women migrations and governance are interconnected and are complementary.

The design of Specific Objectives (SO)1 addresses the "structural" level of managing safe migration for aspiring women in an inclusive and comprehensive way. To this end, the project's interventions can be grouped into four distinct types of actions based on multi-stakeholders' approach:

- Preparing and disseminating guidance and information materials on safe migration and government services;
- Revising government training curriculum for addressing women and gender issues;
- Capacity building and strengthening activities; and
- Enhancing institutional responses to safeguard interests of women and reducing their vulnerability to exploitative migration.

The design of Specific Objective (SO)2 addresses the actions and levels of information that will support safe, orderly, and regular migration. This goal is to improve understanding of safe migration processes by implementing long-term behavioural changes through trainings, services, and communication campaigns

in the project areas. Through awareness-raising initiatives, messages on safe migration, generating materials for community dialogues, and advocacy workshops, the SO2 addresses various stakeholders and aims for a very broad coverage. It also provides life skills-based pre-decision orientation on safe migration, risk and vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights and legal support, and communication, among other things. The long-term goals of SO2 outputs are to change behaviour. Its design, on the other hand, is not very distinct from some of SO1's activities, such as video documentary. At this level, it's also unclear how the project identified its stakeholders.

In December 2019, CARE Bangladesh and WARBE-DF linked a partnership agreement for the implementation of SO1 and SO2 with technical assistance from CARE Bangladesh. This collaboration is important and complementary because WARBE-DF is present throughout the country and has experience of implementing a variety of social programmes, including migration. The CARE Bangladesh on the other hand, has extensive experience of working with governments on legal and institutional capacity building for migration management which is more focused on governance and includes SO1.

In April 2020, the project launched a baseline survey. The survey revealed significant information about levels of awareness about safe migration, available services and basic rights. However, the interim reports draw a little on the findings from the base-line survey of the Project. While this report serves as a foundation for all subsequent awareness-raising activities, it was initiated in the mid-first year of the project. In general, the expected results are designed in accordance with the objectives and use a holistic approach.

The Project did not anticipate the risk of any pandemic and hence no risk mitigating strategy was designed. The Project, however, coped with the situation by setting a revised target and adapting to the virtual means of implementation. In future, projects should be designed with more flexibility in order to adjust with pandemic-like situations.

3.2 INCLUSIVE COVERAGE, GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND CROSS CUTTING ISSUES

Evaluation Question 2.1: Have all the targeted populations benefitted equitably (fairly) from the intervention? Where? How? Were any subgroups left behind?

- The Project focuses on “improving the capacity of targeted government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly, and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers,” as well as “empowering women in rural communities to make informed migration decisions and access services.” Men are rarely included in the Project.
- The Project's objectives and design also respond to CARE's global gender equality and women empowerment approach in implementing the UN 2030 Agenda by focusing primarily on managing migration at the individual level, through support to women aspirant migrants at the social and host community levels, and at the "structural" level related to policies and their successful implementation.
- The goals and their design are based on CARE's worldwide gender equality and women empowerment approach, which includes exercising greater choices over decisions that affect women's lives, eliminating violence against women, and building social movements based on women's solidarity and men's participation, promoting women's empowerment and strengthening ties with the Government of Bangladesh (GoB).
- The Project includes potential, aspirant and returnee women migrants. Minorities and disabled women remained outside the purview of the Project. The beneficiaries do not cover students and working women. In terms of institutions the Project targeted law makers, government functionaries, the lowest administrative unit of the government (UP chairmen and members) and local and national CSOs.
- There is no evidence in the Project’s activities of any consideration of specific cross-cutting issues, mainly environmental and climate change issues, neither in the expected outputs.

Evaluation Question 2.2 : How could the activities be modified to improve their acceptability of targeted communities in future similar initiatives?

- The activities could be modified in the similar Project by involving men and women family members of migrant women.
- Education institutions, religious leaders and local-level law enforcement agencies i.e. Ansars and VDPs can be included in similar projects.
- In future, religious and other minority women should be consciously included in similar projects.

3.3 EFFECTIVENESS

This sub-section analyses the extent to which the project's objectives and outputs were met considering the project's result chain and indicators, baseline and target figures.

Evaluation Question 3.1: To which degree did the activities meet the objectives and results set out in the project as outlined in the logical framework, measured against baseline and target figures?

Box 1: Effectiveness of the CARE Project

Judgement Criteria 3.1.1: Pre-departure of support services are of good quality and women friendly.

Judgement Criteria 3.1.2: Partnerships with the national, district and local level institutions and the private sector, have proven successful and are likely to continue.

Judgement Criteria 3.1.3: Partnerships with GoB have been satisfactory.

Judgement Criteria 3.1.4: Communication and awareness-raising efforts are successful.

Judgement Criteria 3.1.5: Efforts to expand access to safe migration services through CBOs and Union Digital Centers are excellent in terms of reaching aspirant migrants, their families, and the migrant communities they serve, as well as increasing referral procedures and ensuring institutional services.

Effectiveness at the Objectives Level

Through the overall objective, the Project pursues two main specific goals: strengthening the capacity of designated government entities to develop gender-responsive migration policies and processes, and women in rural areas are empowered to make informed decisions about safe and orderly migration, and they have access to migration services that reduce vulnerability and exploitation and strengthen women resilience. All the outputs and activities of the overall objective have been implemented to achieve these goals.

The **Specific Objective (SO) 1 required** consultation and cooperation with the GoB and mainly with the Ministry of Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment (MoEWOE), Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training (BMET), Technical Training Centers (TTC), the District Employment and Manpower Office (DEMO), and the Bangladesh Overseas Employment and Services Limited (BOESL). For this objective, the Project collaborated with relevant ministries and government institutions, as well as agencies and public-private partnerships such as the Bangladesh Association of International Recruitment Agencies (BAIRA) and non-governmental organisations (NGOs).

The drafting of the content of the safe migration information packages began in November 2020, and the learning materials (flip charts) for the courtyard meeting's content was completed in December 2020, with printing completed in January 2021. The project information one-pagers in English and Bangla were completed and distributed at the Upazila level during advocacy meetings. Furthermore, the content of a pocket book was finalised and printed for distribution in June 2021. A booklet and information board on safe migration were also created and distributed by project implementing partner WARBE-DF. The Project also began reviewing the government training curriculum for addressing women and gender issues in April 2021, and it was completed in August 2021 with a revised curriculum for domestic workers to be incorporated in TTC training.

During the Project, four Upazila-level advocacy sessions were held. A total of 167 people attended (92 women and 75 men) the programmes including 16 women who were victims of migration and told their important case stories. Women put allegations against employers in destination countries and the role of middlemen. Local stakeholders made recommendations for policy changes or improvements. The meeting's evidence was analysed and forwarded to WARBE- DF's grievance management committee for legal and other procedural considerations. Women migrant workers case study report was published in September 2021.

The first annual discussion between migrants, government officials and relevant stakeholders was held on 10 June 2021 followed by another annual online dialogue on 26 August 2021. The discussion provided a forum for potential and returning female migrants to express their concerns, problems, and triumphs, while also raising awareness regarding women's migration issues among policymakers to ensure institutional solutions to the issues raised. The most significant recommendation was to establish a fully functional "one-stop service centre" to give all types of support and information to women migrant workers about safe migration. The centre would not only focus on the workers' departure, job, and return home, but it would also help migrants to address issues associated with psychological and physical torture and abuses.

On September 19, 2021, in partnership with the Daily Prothom Alo, an advocacy meeting on ILO convention C189 and Global Compact on Migration (GCM) was organised. It recommended preparing a statistical survey on the severity of abuse and exploitation of migrant domestic and internal domestic workers; conduct a technical analysis and assessment on whether the articles of C189 are feasible to implement and improve the support service mechanism.

The **Specific Objective (SO) 2's** outputs and activities were directed toward communication and knowledge-based information sharing on existing pre-decision services and support systems for prospective women migrants, as well as with multiple stakeholders- primarily at the local level and with a wide coverage. The Project used a number of activities and cooperated with a variety of stakeholders to raise awareness, promote, and manage safe migration. The Project elaborated materials for community dialogue and established a network of women information champions that would serve as an informal information conduit for aspirant migrants in their vicinity.

From the beginning of the Project, women information champions were identified, selected, and trained up for capacity building to impart migration services. As soon as COVID-19 restriction was partially released from August 2020, three community meetings were held to mobilise the community in Keraniganj and Nawabganj Upazillas, with a total of 108 attendees (100 women and 08 men). In February 2021, 2 CBOs were successfully formed in Keraniganj and Nawabganj, each with 20 and 22 women. They were provided training and the trainees were taught about the formation and operation of a CBO, as well as member collection and financial management. After that, a 9-member Executive Committee was constituted, consisting of a President, a General Secretary, a Cashier, a Vice President, two Joint Secretaries, and three Executive Members. The Executive Committee was expected to work together to register the CBO with the government and recruit more members.

All ten Migration Corners became operational in December 2020 and began disseminating information through the Project's trained Women Information Champions and UDC entrepreneurs. During the COVID-

19 lockdown, however, the number of visits to the migration corners dropped to zero. A total of 75 courtyard meetings were organized out of the original aim of 120. The meetings were led by eight information champions from the various unions, who were overseen by the Centre in-Charge of WARBE-DF’s Project office, who facilitated the sessions. The women in attendance were given an overview of safe migration and its different processes, which included gathering accurate information and documentation in order to make an informed migration decision, gender leadership and various ways of communication.

The module of the Life Skills-based pre-decision orientation on safe migration, risk and vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights and legal support and communication was completed in March 2021. Based on this module, in Nawabganj and Keraniganj, a total of 25 training sessions were held. A total of 630 people attended the training at the end. All participants were women between the ages of 18 to 40, and the majority of them aspired to migrate overseas as labour migrants. Some of the participants were returnee migrants who intended to re-migrate. Brief lecture sessions and group activities, such as making posters, drawing pictures, and acting out instant drama, were organised to deliver training to participants. The participants were provided with a certificate acknowledging their participation in the training. They were also supplied with a migration information booklet on safe migration developed by CARE Bangladesh.

Referral service providers were unable to go beyond their areas due to COVID-19 constraints, resulting in a much lower number of services compared to the target. Information champions and UDC entrepreneurs were able to refer 32 returnees and one aspirant migrant to BMET, WARBE's grievance receiving cell, and the government's financial assistance programme for returnee women migrants who returned to Bangladesh during the COVID-19 pandemic.

The creative firm was chosen for developing the animated video highlighting the important topic of migration and exploitation through middlemen. The production began in March 2021 and was completed in June 2021. The animated docu-movie was shown at all trainings arranged in Keraniganj and Nawabganj under the Project. The Project also planned to project the video animation at the Upazila Parishad.

From the above stocktaking, it is evident that various interventions (activities) of the Project were interconnected. Yet, despite the high number of attendees and participants, little data was available to measure or comprehend the effects of these events on the participants. The lack of qualitative indicators affected the overall effectiveness of the Project to some degree.

Effectiveness at the Outcome and Activity Level

Table 11: Status of Project Achievements at the Outcome, Output and Activity Levels

Outcome	Output	Activities	Status of Achievements
Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to	Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration	A 1.1: Development of Information Package A 1.2 : Review govt. training curriculum for addressing women and gender issues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved • Achieved

<p>facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers</p>		<p>A 1.3: Conduct TOT for BMET & TTC A 1.4: Evidence based advocacy meetings at upazila level A 1.5: Advocacy meetings with stakeholders at district level A 1.6: Organization of annual dialogue sessions/meetings between migrants and government officials/relevant stakeholders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved
	<p>Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments</p>	<p>A 2.1: Advocacy meetings with CEDAW Committee A 2.2: Advocacy meetings on ILO convention C189 and GCM A 2.3: Launch and publishing of case study report of Women Migrant Workers A 2.4: Desk Study on comparative scenario of female migrant workers in South Asia region A 2.5: Round-table dialogue on case-story and study findings with key stakeholders</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved
<p>Outcome 2 Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services</p>	<p>Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access to information on safe migration and decent work</p>	<p>A 3.1: Organize Community Meetings at Union level for community mobilization A 3.2: Training of women information champions A 3.3: Life skills based pre-decision orientation on safe migration, risk & vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights & legal support, communication etc. A 3.4: Conduct 75 court yard meetings on safe migration including returnee migrants</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved

		A 3.5: Develop video documentation and conduct screening sessions	
	Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centers have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level	A 4.1 Establish safe migration corners at Union Digital Centres/Union Parishad A4.2 Train UDC entrepreneurs A 4.3 Form and functionalize CBOs A 4.4 CBO members trained on migration and gender	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved • Achieved

Evaluation Question 3.2: Are the result indicators and their means of verification adequate?

The Project was successful in taking the services at door steps of women aspirant migrants. However, no mechanism was there to measure the extent to which the information centres were playing an effective role in women’s decision making. Some women champions have become members of the CBO. It’s a sign of continuation and effectiveness of the component. Yet, it does not automatically ensure the effectiveness of the component unless the CBOs are functionalised. KII and IDI with relevant stakeholders reveal that due to the less number of effective days caused by COVID-19 lockdowns, WARBE-DF could not build the rapport with UDCs and UP members and chairs as was required and expected. “The approach was more business-oriented. The people in the area now know about safe migration. However, they don’t know what to do if someone is in danger” -informed one key informant.

In the absence of a measurable indicator, no outcomes could have been measured qualitatively over the project's 1.8 year period. The Project thus suffered from a results-based approach and also lost opportunities to measure the outcomes leaving impact on improvising the project's outputs, intervention modes, and activities.

3.4 EFFICIENCY

This section analyses whether the Project was run in an efficient way considering the management set-up and partnership between CARE and WARBE-DF on the ground to identify strengths and opportunities of the overall implementation process, management, communication and collaboration so far.

Evaluation Question 4.1: Was the Project run in an efficient way considering quality of programme delivery and partnership management?

- The Project was mainly implemented by WARBE-DF whereas CARE was in supervision and implementation of some specific components of the same. The Project was efficiently managed by both organizations. In WARBE-DF the team was composed of a Project Coordinator, a Deputy Project Coordinator, a Project Officer, 2 Field Officers and 2 Field Office Assistants. WARBE-DF recruited efficient and experienced workers which helped run the Project efficiently.
- Work responsibilities were clearly defined though some overlapping of performances were found. The Project however, had no provision for staffs' capacity building on a regular basis. Each Project staff worked closely with their supervisors, received orientation from the supervisor/manager and learned by themselves while performing their responsibilities. The field officers attended whole-day trainings at the WARBE-DF head office. While they were clear about their assignments, a general lack of awareness about Project's general and specific objectives was noticed among the medium and lower level project staff.
- WARBE-DF conducted its weekly and daily communications with staff stationed in the head office and in the Project Office in Nawabganj and Keraniganj. WARBE-DF followed indicator –based reporting template to be filled up by Project staff.

At CARE's end, Project Manager maintained full time coordination and supervision of programme delivery and quality. Training modules and guidelines were provided by CARE to WARBE-DF. CARE closely worked with its other partners too. Due to the Corona pandemic, however, CARE head office was run in 30% capacity. Due to sustained lockdowns, CARE's project activity monitoring was hampered by fewer visits to the field. **It took alternative measures such as monitoring and receiving regular updates about project activities through weekly online meetings.**

- CARE used to have weekly meetings with partner organizations. WARBE-DF and CARE used to share their work plans and regularly discussed their strategic interventions especially during the COVID-19 period. WARBE used its advocacy network and civil society platforms for efficient delivery of the programmes. For example, it had successfully invested in its resources and networks with the Parliamentary Caucus Committee. WARBE-DF also drew on its experiences of CBO formation in its other project areas.

Evaluation Question 4.2: What are the strengths and opportunities to the overall implementation process, management, communication and collaboration?

- The Project conducted a baseline survey. A MEAL Plan was also developed to strengthen its monitoring system. Monthly targets and formats for filling out the activities were provided by WARBE-DF to the field officers. Yet, data to measure the qualitative impacts and outcome of the Project was not well-organized.
- Under Output 1 and 2, WARBE was efficient enough to arrange adequate numbers of national and local consultations despite the pandemic situation. The Life Skills (LS) training was planned to be conducted by women champions. However, IDI with Project staff revealed that due to the pandemic situation, women champions' capacity could not be built to the level of trainers. Professional trainers were therefore employed to maintain the quality and timeline of the LS trainings. Some of the activities could not be achieved on time for example, Training of the Trainers (ToTs) on female training modules could not be arranged till writing this report. The national dialogue on CEDAW convention was arranged in

September 2021. The implementation of field activities was immensely interrupted by the pandemic situation.

- Under Output 3 and 4, women champions and UDC entrepreneurs received formal 2-day's training on migration and relevant services. Training guidelines were prepared by WARBE-DF and training was imparted by the WARBE-DF manager and officers. CARE and WARBE-DF attempted to increase the efficiency of the training by dividing the trainees in small groups and keeping 3 returnee trainees in each group. The idea behind was implementing a peer learning system. There was, however, no mechanism to monitor the efficiency of this coping strategy. The efficiency of the trainings was also compromised to some extent by the non-residential nature of the training. An additional round of training was arranged to enhance training qualities.
- Timewise the Project was granted 5 months' no cost extension once in July and in September 2020. To accomplish remaining work (6 months' work) and to finish unspent budget, WARBE-DF recruited two field assistants.

Evaluation Question 4.3: What factors appear to promote or challenge the activity operations or effective collaboration and cooperation among the various stakeholders?

- The Project was too big to be implemented in a short span of time. Each of the four components demands sufficient time allotment for efficient outputs.
- There was a lack of smooth functioning of the Project due to the countrywide lockdowns in intervals related to the pandemic situation. Project activities had not been achieved in accordance with the plan due to the pandemic. Some activities such as, national dialogues and ToTs were deferred due to the pandemic.
- To adjust with the situation the Project raised the number of activities and lessened the number of participants in each activity. A number of other adjustments had to be made as mentioned earlier.

Evaluation Question 4.4: Is a sufficient communication system in place to capture and share lessons learned for project adaptations?

- The Project had to adopt several 'coping mechanisms' to deliver the desired outcome at the wake of the pandemic. Sufficient communications between the head office and the field and also between CARE and WARBE-DF were evident to this purpose. Staff informed that new ideas of adjusting activities in new time frames often came from the implementing partners at the field.
- Project's budget was realigned with revised plan of activities and approved by the higher authorities through intervention by the CARE Project Manager - and the team.
- The CBO and UDC appeared to be the weakest components of the Project in terms of efficiency and implementation. There was a gap between the desired and actual accomplishment of training. Longer time was required to engage participants with the content of the training.

Evaluation Question 4.5: To what extent were the resources such as funds, expertise, and time utilized to produce the desired changes?

- To measure efficiency, the study has reviewed the funds, expertise, and time utilized by the Project (See Table 12). Detailed data for the funding and expertise were not available. The economic or monetary value of various outputs of the Project was also not available. In the absence of such detailed data, it was not possible to conduct a cost-benefit analysis of the Project.
- The Project had an approved budget of Euro 250,000. This appears to have produced a value for money with a wide variety of project outputs including enhanced capacity of BMET, DEMO and TTCs to provide gender responsive training and services, producing women information champions, UDC migration information corners, knowledge sharing among policymakers and CSOs regarding safe labour migration and formation of community based organizations. From a qualitative point of view and using non-monetary value, outputs represent piloting of a broad intervention.
- The Project got a lifespan of 18 months (November 2019 to September 2021), and two no-cost extensions for three months due to disruption of project activities during the Covid-19 pandemic. Normative and systems change in any public sector is a time consuming matter, and hence with the given financial and human resources and time, the Project appears to be somewhat less efficient in producing high-impact deliverables.

Table 12: Funds, Expertise and Time Utilized by the Migration Project

Desired Outcomes	Desired Outputs	Funds Utilized (Euro)		Expertise Utilized	Time Utilized
		Nov 19-October 2020	Nov 20-August 21		
Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers	Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration	64,465.51	131,124.12	National Professional Staff, Consultants, Local Support Staff	November 2020-August 2021
	Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments				National Professional Staff, Consultants, Local Support Staff

Outcome 2 Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services	Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access to information on safe migration and decent work			National Professional Staff, Consultants, Local Support Staff	November 2019- August 2020 LST: March 2021
	Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centers have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level			National Professional Staff, Consultants, Local Support Staff	UDCs: December 2020 CBOs: February 2021

Source: Prepared based on IDIs with CARE Officials

3.5 IMPACT

This section presents the evidence of expected and unexpected as well as positive and negative changes against the Project’s objectives. It identifies lessons learned and powerful intervention to leverage for future initiative. Impact of the Project is evaluated at the Objective and Outcome levels. Both quantitative and qualitative data were used for assessing the impact of the Project.

Evaluation Question no. 5.1: What evidence of changes-expected and unexpected, positive and negative, do community members and other stakeholders show against the project’s interventions?

Judgment Criteria 5.1.1 Women are empowered to take informed decisions regarding labour migration

According to the survey results, around 85% of women, who received training from the project, have solved a real-life problem by applying the knowledge learned during the training. Besides, the following table shows the number and the percentage of women received training and participated in courtyard meetings arranged by CARE/WARBE:

Table 13: Volume of Participation of Women in at least one WARBE/CARE programme

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage
Participated	202	88.6 %
Did not participate	9	3.9 %
Not answered	17	7.5 %
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Box 2: KII Responses on the Development of Women’s Awareness about Safe Migration.

“Women are now more empowered and most of them can get information from legal sources. They can also avoid the involvement of intermediaries throughout their migration process.” (Ashiqur Rahman, UDC Entrepreneur, Konda, Keraniganj)

“WARBE Project activities were accomplished with some positive implications in my society. General people are now more aware about the issues of female labour migration than ever before. Women and their family members are now more encouraged to go abroad for work.” (Doly Chowdhury, Member of Agla Union Parishad, Agla, Nowabgonj)

“WARBE Project has a number of positive impacts. As a staff member, I have also been educated from the Project on many issues regarding international female labour migration from Bangladesh. My skills of interpersonal communication and presentation have also been uplifted from the activities that I have carried out throughout the project.” (Ria Akhter, Assistant Center In-charge, WARBE, Nawabganj)

Table 14: Volume of Participation of Women in WARBE/CARE Trainings and Courtyard Meetings

Types of Participation	Training Sessions/ Workshops		Courtyard Meetings	
	Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage
Not participated	3	1.3%	20	8.8%
Less than or equal to 2	178	78.1%	167	73.2%
3 to 4	37	16.2%	22	9.6%
5 or above	5	2.2%	2	0.9%
Not answered	5	2.2%	17	7.5%
Total	228	100%	228	100%

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

The aforesaid table reveals that around a quarter of the women, who received services from the Project, have participated in an average of 1 or 2 training sessions and courtyard meetings during the specific time-frame of the Project. Among these women, more than 78% participated in at least 1 training session or workshop, whereas around 73% have experiences of joining in at least one courtyard meeting. More than 16% women received 3-4 training within the time-frame of the Project, while the percentage of women participating in the same number of courtyard meetings stands around 10%. Only a very few women (3 out of 228) did not participate in any training session or workshop. On the other hand, 20 of the total respondents (228) have not taken part in any of the courtyard meetings.

Judgment Criteria 5.1.2: The Project contributed to increased awareness among migrant women

Female labour migrants from Bangladesh, both aspirants and returnees, have received services from the Project to become aware about the welfare programmes of the government and non-government sectors, including the rights and duties of female migrants within the system of international labour migration, the operation of *Probashi Kalyan Bank*, the process of getting government loans, the mechanisms for dealing with the passport and visa issue, the process of obtaining employment contract, and so on.

Table 15: Volume of respondents (women) aware about the basic rights of women and migrant workers

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage
Know about the basic rights of women and migrant workers	190	83.3%
Do not Know about the basic rights of women and migrant workers	38	16.7%
Total	228	100%

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

The aforesaid table shows that more than 83% women among the target group of the Project have obtained ideas about the basic rights of women and migrant workers due to Project’s interventions.

Table 16: Response of target group about the usefulness of the project activities to raise their awareness about the rights of women and migrant workers

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage
The activities were useful	210	92.1%
The activities were not useful	6	2.6%
Not answered	12	5.3%
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

More than 92% respondents found that WARBE/CARE Project activities were useful to learn about the issues related to the rights of women and migrant workers.

Judgment Criteria 5.1.3: The project contributed to enhancing the life-skills of female migrant workers

The following table shows the specific knowledge and life-skills the respondents obtained from the programs:

Table 17: Knowledge/ life-skills the respondents obtained from WARBE/CARE Project

Types of knowledge/ Life Skills obtained from the project activities	Number of respondents obtained the knowledge/ Life Skills (each question was answered by 228 respondents)	Percentage of respondents obtained the knowledge/ Life Skills
Gender Equality	129	56.6%
Leadership	45	19.7%
Stress and Time Management	34	14.9%
Problem solving and decision making	94	41.2%
Communication & Negotiation	43	18.9%
Savings and Investment	102	44.7%
Personal security and safety	106	46.5%
Professional excellence, confidence and management	35	15.4%

Sexual harassment abuses and exploitation	103	45.2%
Legal support	60	26.3%
Decision making to migrate	97	42.5%
Knowledge on migration: Information on countries of destinations, Cost-benefit analysis, economic and social costs.	147	64.5%
Migration Information and Services by different government & non-government bodies	52	22.8%
Financial literacy and Remittance Management	70	30.7%

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Trainees gained knowledge about gender equality, savings and investment, personal safety and security, sexual harassment, abuses and exploitation, knowledge on migration (information on countries of destinations, cost-benefit analysis, economic and social costs. Around 75% respondents informed that the knowledge was applicable whereas more than 80% responded said that the training helped them to make decisions in their daily life (Table 18 and 19).

Table 18: Application of the knowledge/skills gathered from WARBE/CARE training programmes

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage
Knowledge/ skills were applicable	169	74.1 %
Knowledge/ skills were not applicable	48	21.1 %
Not answered	11	4.8%
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Table 19: The impact of project activities over solving a real-life problem of the respondents

Whether the project activities were helpful to solve a real-life problem by applying the knowledge learned by the respondents from those activities	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
The activities were helpful	193	84.6 %
Not answered	35	15.4 %
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Around 90 % of total respondents have opined that their awareness level and life skills have been improved in significant ways from the training of WARBE/CARE programmes (See Table 19).

Table 20: The volume of awareness /training of safe migration and life skills obtained by the respondents

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Not improved at all	1	0.4 %
Improved a little	7	3.1 %
Slightly improved	62	27.2 %
Fairly improved	87	38.2 %
Greatly improved	58	25.4 %
Not answered	13	5.7 %
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Apart from general skills received by the respondents, there are some specific life skills offered throughout the project activities related with healthcare issues. Table 21 shows the volume of respondents received life-skill information/training from the Project. Around three-quarter of the respondents received healthcare information pertaining to the process of international labour migration of women from Bangladesh (Table 21).

Table 21: Volume of respondents received information on health related risks associated with migration (life skill)

Types of Responses	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Received information	170	74.6 %
Not received information	47	20.6 %
Not answered	11	4.8 %
Total	228	100 %

Source: End-line survey of CARE evaluation

Judgment Criteria 5.1.4: Local leaders and service providers are better informed about migration.

The study however revealed that the extent to which local women, leaders and entrepreneurs would be able to provide the service was beyond the control of the Project.

Judgment Criteria 5.1.5: The community became informed and aware of the importance of safe labour migration of women.

KIIs and FGDs with local stakeholders confirmed that the training programmes helped increase awareness among general people, government officials in the local areas and other responsible members of the society about the opportunities and the challenges of international labour migration.

Judgment Criteria 5.1.6: The project provided welfare to the returnee migrants.

Returnee women migrants were informed and, in some cases, received financial benefits from government and non-government sources. The Project was benefitted by targeting returnee women as they could reflect on their experiences during interventions i.e. trainings and meetings.

Judgment Criteria 5.1.7: Issues related to intermediaries have been reduced but not diminished

The study found the prevalence of intermediaries in the Project areas. Women who became victim of fraudulence showed less interest to be involved in the Project activities.

Most of the women in our society, who want or plan to go abroad for work, fall into the trap of intermediaries/ Dalals, which often makes them victims of fraudulence. In that case, WARBE Project had a significant positive impact. (Sazzad Hossain, UDC Entrepreneur, Agla, Nawabgonj)

Judgment Criteria 5.1.8: The project has an impact of reducing the social taboos regarding female migration

Though the entire social stigma about the international labour migration of women has not been diminished from the project areas, the KIIs and FGDs have pointed out that, the Project contributed to change the negative mind set of the society regarding female migration.

While earlier women used to go abroad without informing about the community after implementation of the Project the community members now openly share information about female migration. They also contact UDC for information. There was an idea that only divorced and deserted women are meant to be migrants. Now that perspective is changed. Men used to attend community meeting too. Now they have rather a positive mindset about migration. (Sazzad Hossain, UDC Entrepreneur, Agla, Nawabgonj)

- KII with UP members and chairmen revealed that they were not fully aware of female migration before the Project. They took part in local arbitration regarding fraudulence cases. The training increased their capacity to ensure safe migration and establish the rights of female migrants. The Project has also connected them with DEMO.
- Women champions who were at first skeptical about the Project outcomes, later became prime change makers. They expressed their commitment to provide services to the aspirant migrants by virtue of the trainings imparted by the Project.
- Through the national level dialogue, CSOs put pressure on government for taking measures to make female migration safer through training, returnees’ experience sharing and so on. The dialogues offered a platform for quality discussion and were identified by stakeholders as ‘change makers’ in terms of ensuring rights and privileges of the female migrant workers.

Evaluation Question no. 5.2: What factors appear to promote and deter these changes?

Promoting Factors

- The activities arranged at the national level were instrumental in creating participants’ commitment towards bringing normative and practical changes regarding safe labour migration. The members of Parliamentarians’ Caucus, CSO members and GoB officials (BMET officials, DEMO officials) discussed the gaps in adoption and implementation of laws on protection of women workers.
- The involvement of the local and district governments i.e., Upazila Nirbahi Officers (UNOs), UP chairmen and members also admitted about the Project’s contribution to bringing a positive outlook to female migration.
- The Project promoted changes through evidence based advocacy. It collected cases of women migrants, published them and discussed in the dialogues and roundtables with stakeholders and courtyard meetings and trainings.
- Establishment and functioning of UDC migration corners created migrants’ access to online information about migration and returnee reintegration.

WARBE's project was very useful for both aspirant or returnee migrants, since the project provided a platform where these migrants could find information and access to both government and non-government facilities related to international labour migration from Bangladesh. The Project encouraged educating the target groups about online facilities about migration and related financial issues. (MD. Shahabuddin, UDC Entrepreneur, Aganagar, Keraniganj)

- The dialogues and trainings had been able to change the mindset of the local leaders and service providers about providing migration information to aspirant migrants. Although the extent to which they will provide the service is beyond the control of the project anymore.
- CBOs, UDCs and Women Information Champions took the migration information services at women migrants' door steps.

Deterring Factors

- Due to the short duration of the Project, institutional capacity building could not be achieved at its expected level.
- The COVID-19 pandemic seriously affected the magnitude and speed of changes. Due to lockdowns and social distancing factors, the project outcomes were sporadic and failed to make a continuous impact on the targeted beneficiaries.
- The Project had too many activities to be performed in two years' time. To ensure quantity of the activities, quality was compromised at some points.
- The qualitative impact could not be measured with the available data.

Evaluation Question no. 2: Which interventions appear to be more or less potential to influence knowledge or behaviours?

Table 22: The Potential of Interventions

Objectives	Interventions	Level of Potential to Influence Knowledge and Behaviour
Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers	Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration	Medium
	Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments	High
Outcome 2: Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and	Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access	High

decisions about migration and are able to access services	to information on safe migration and decent work	
	Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centers have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level	Medium

Prepared based on the Survey, KIIs, FGDs and IDIs results

Box 3 : 10 Key Statements made by Local- level FGDs Participants

1. *“The project activities were directly related to the general masses and we closely worked with these people. So, the project activities enabled us to carry out our duties of making people aware, especially local women, about the risks, benefits and opportunities of international female labour migration from Bangladesh.”*
2. *“The project enabled different actors in the society, including political leaders, community service providers and government officials working in localities, and trained them repeatedly about the necessary aspects of international labour migration.”*
3. *“Women in our communities are now more aware about the problems and opportunities of international female labour migration and they are more encouraged to go for a safer migration process through government and non-government sources.”*
4. *“Women are now more empowered in their own families, especially with regard to making decisions about their children’s education and financial matters in the family. Root-level awareness raising campaigns, such as courtyard meetings have been very useful to reach out more and more target groups for the project.”*
5. *“Trainings of government and non-government officials throughout the project have enabled these service providers to accomplish their routine work more efficiently... The overall condition of women has improved over the last two years, especially with regard to their ability of decision-making within their own families.”*
6. *“The Project was effective to address the underlying factors relating to the issue of international labour migration from Bangladesh, including fraudulence by intermediaries, paperwork, financial issues and so on.”*
7. *“By disseminating the necessary information about different aspects of international female labour migration, the trained community leaders and women champions played a frontline role to make the target community, aspirant/potential/returnee women, aware about the access to different services relating to international female labour migration.”*
8. *“Increasing the awareness among women at the community level and uplifting of their financial condition through international labour migration enabled these women to raise their voice to protect their own rights not only in their families, but also in their own societies.”*
9. *“Trainings and courtyard meetings have been very effective to raise awareness among women about promoting safe migration, rights and interests. Raising awareness at the community level also made it possible to lessen the volume of social stigma about international female labour migration and to remove social barriers on this issue.”*

1. *“In some cases, women wanted to participate in WARBE programs. But due to limited opportunities, those women could not join the programs, such as the courtyard meetings...The Project needs to be extended in order to maximize its positive outcomes in future.”*

3.6 SUSTAINABILITY

This section assesses the sustainability of the Safe Migration Project. In doing so it asks the following questions:

Evaluation Question 6.1: Has the project developed and implemented sustainability?

Evaluation Question 6.2: To what extent were local government officials, formal and informal local actors/leaders involved in project activities and included in ongoing programme discussions?

Evaluation Question 6.3: Are there proper identification of roles on who should be doing what after the project’s end?

Answers to the above questions are sought below at the output level.

Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration

o The Project has developed information packages, reviewed government training curricula for addressing women and gender issues, conducted evidence based advocacy at Upazila level, conducted advocacy meetings with stakeholders at the district level and organized annual dialogues and meeting sessions with relevant stakeholders i.e. local CSO members and activists. These activities were designed as part of an ongoing process of ensuring safe female labour migration and are expected to sustain.

o The information package produced and distributed at the local level has helped develop the knowledge of the local level administrators and public representatives who expressed their willingness to use the knowledge in their routine communications, briefings and meeting with the public and other stakeholders. UP chairman and members started including migration in their monthly meeting agenda which is a significant achievement in terms of sustainability. However, key stakeholders expressed their concerns saying that the activities are hard to continue without a formal instruction from the GoB to include the safe migration of women into their work agenda.

o The BMET and TTC’s have expressed their willingness to address women and gender issues identified by experts through curriculum review. The ToT receivers are expected to include women and gender issues in their upcoming training. GoB officials expressed their willingness to carry out robust training programmes for female migrants. This component will however not sustain without incorporating the reviewed items into the TTC training module. CARE should follow up the process.

Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments.

- o Under this output, the Safe Migration Project has conducted advocacy meetings with relevant stakeholders i.e. CEDAW Committee, law makers, CSO activists and practitioners on ILO Convention C 189 and GCM. It also shared its knowledge products i.e. the women migrants' case studies and research report on female migration in South Asia with relevant stakeholders.
- o From the perspectives of rights, welfare, and social protection, the dialogues would play a crucial role in bringing positive changes in the lives of migrant women. Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments. The members of the Parliamentary Caucus committee have expressed their interest and commitment to follow up with the recommendations such as ratification of ILO Convention 189, establishing one stop services and employment contracts for women, to make recruitment agencies more accountable and so on. The GoB expressed interest to have a dedicated institutional structure at Upazila level to implement the rights of female migration.
- o Civil society members and BOAF has expressed their willingness to carry on dialogues on female migration issues regularly on their own initiatives.
- o There is a need to invest in the implementation of the legal and policy frameworks to sustain their benefits for the migrant women.

Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access to information on safe migration and decent work

- o Under this output, the Safe Migration Project has organized community meetings at Union Level for community mobilization, trained up women information champions, provided women with Life Skills based pre-decision orientation on safe migration, risk and vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights and legal support, communication and so on. It has conducted Court Yard meetings on safe migration and arranged video screening sessions for aspirant and returnee women.
- o The component on producing Women Information Champions was designed taking the 'sustainability' component in consideration. The Project left trained and empowered Women Information Champions in the intervention areas. While they are fully equipped to continue their information providing services, they are unlikely to continue their services without follow up and minimum self-sustaining support. Sustainability of Women Champions can also be ensured by their likely employment and use by similar projects implemented by the same or other NGOs and donors.
- o In order to enhance the benefit of the Life Skills based training module WARBE-DF and CARE need to ensure that the modules are used in similar other projects.

Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centres have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level

- o Under this output, the Safe Migration Project has established migration corners at 10 selected UDCs in Keraniganj and Nawabganj. It provided training to the UDC entrepreneurs regarding safe migration so that they can help locals with migration and reintegration related information. Two CBOs were established at the end of the project to sustain the facilitation of migration services.
- o Output 4 is thus the most sustainable component of the project. The project left the UDC migration corners at the local level with training to provide migration and reintegration information. The local people know about their existence and are expected to avail their services after the withdrawal of project activities.
- o CBOs are part of the sustainability plan of the project. They are expected to continue providing information and referral services to migrants and returnees after the project ends. There is a high possibility that CBOs will sustain. However, sustainability of the CBOs are subject to their registration, follow up and introduction of self-sustaining activities. Without any incentives they are unlikely to function in the ways in which the project expects them to perform it.
- o This component can sustain if WARBE-DF or CARE maintain communication with CBOs and UDCs.

3.7 COHERENCE AND SYNERGY

This sub-section discusses the compatibility of the intervention with other similar interventions in the country.

Evaluation Question 7.1: To which extent were synergies used or built with other activities implemented by other NGOs, IOs, government, and with local initiatives?

- o The end-line evaluation found compatibility of the Project interventions with other similar interventions in the country. The Project has synergies with the GoB 's overall agenda on migration as reflected in 8th five-year plan. It includes institutional and legislative reform, institutional capacity building, , skill development, access to services, protection of rights and well-being: digitalisation and private sector and stakeholder engagement. The Project also commensurate with action plans of GoB to accomplish the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs and The National Skills Development Policy 2011 .
- o Synergies were also built with CSO advocacy and activities regarding safe female labour migration from Bangladesh and the protection of women workers rights at home and abroad. WARBE-DF has successfully drawn its resources in its network with South Asian Parliamentarian and BOAF-the network of local NGOs.
- o The project certainly builds on pre-existing knowledge on migration that was created and is being created by interventions by a NGO/CBO/CSO at the field level. In this case, survey participants mentioned the name of WARBE, which has imparted knowledge and services to them prior to this programme. Service availability from UDCs (Union Digital Center) is also mentioned that suggests a clear partnership with GoB apparatus at the field level. Whether they had prior knowledge of any other programme on migration a good 52 percent of people answered in affirmative (see Table: 23).

Table – 23: Respondents’ Knowledge about availability of Migration Services in the Community

Response of Migrants	Frequency	Percent
Yes	119	52.2
No	103	45.2
Total	222	97.4
Missing	6	2.6
	228	100.0

Source: End-line survey conducted for CARE, 2021

o IDIs with implementing agency confirmed that different NGOs i.e. BRAC, BASTOB and CARITAS working in Nawabganj and Keraniganj areas had different types of rights- based activities in the area, There was however, no coordination of the Safe Migration Project with other projects implemented by other NGOs in the project areas.

Evaluation Question 7.2: To what extent has the project generated collaborative initiatives in producing the desired outcomes? Have the interventions supported (or undermined) other interventions or policies?

Table 23 shows the extent to which the Project has generated collaborative initiatives. Broadly speaking, the Project has successfully brought together a wide variety of stakeholders representing the government, the civil society and non-profit organizations. The level of stakeholders’ collaboration and coordination appeared to be quite high leading to the success of the Project.

Table 24: Collaborative Initiatives of the Safe Migration Project

Desired Outcomes	Desired Outputs	Collaborative Initiatives
Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers	Output 1: Targeted institutions at district/ sub-district level possess relevant understanding and information to offer improved women friendly pre-departure support and services for migration	<input type="checkbox"/> Government: BMET, TTC, DEMO, UNO <input type="checkbox"/> Local Government : UP Chairmen, Members <input type="checkbox"/> Civil Society: BOAF, CWCS
	Output 2: Policy makers and civil society are equipped with knowledge on the implementation of international commitments and areas to be addressed through national commitments	<input type="checkbox"/> Government: Law Makers <input type="checkbox"/> Civil Society Members

<p>Outcome 2: Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services</p>	<p>Output 3: 3000 prospective women migrants at union level have access to information on safe migration and decent work</p>	<p>☐ Government: UP Chairmen and Members</p>
	<p>Output 4: CBOs and Union Digital Centres have improved capacity to facilitate services to aspirant women migrants at national/district/sub-district level</p>	<p>N/A</p>

Prepared based on the KIIs and document review

4. Conclusions

4.1 Overall Assessment of the Project

4.1.1. Appropriateness of the strategy for achieving the strategic goals

As mentioned in the introduction, the primary purpose of the CARE Project was to promote safe and planned migration, particularly for women, as a method of reaching SDGs 5 and 8, as well as to reduce women's vulnerability and exploitation throughout the migration cycle. It also had excessively defined objectives. These are the following:

- i. To enhance the capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers.
- ii. To empower women in rural communities so that they can make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services.

CARE concentrated on a set of project actions to achieve the planned objectives in line with the SDGs 5 and 8 and CARE's Gender Equity Framework (GEF) for women's empowerment through agency, structure and relations. The choice of the implementing partner was successful. With its strong ties with the Bangladesh Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET) as well as the Ministry of Expatriates' Welfare and Overseas Employment, the selection of the WARBE-DF to be the main partner through the Project was highly relevant.

In addition to building the capacity of the targeted Government institutions, WARBE-DF directly engaged with key players at the national and international level to discuss gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly, and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers. WARBE-DF is actively collaborating with the Government of Bangladesh to explore common issues in the UN Convention 1990 on the "Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families", ILO Convention, CEDAW, GFMD, GCM, and UN High-Level Dialogues. Both receiving and sending countries' governments are beginning to recognise WARBE-DF importance's in identifying policy and programme deficiencies and making recommendations for practical procedures to fix such gaps.

Dialogues are essential for policy change. From that perspective, the dialogue component was extremely important to the project. CSOs have also played a vital role in the development of national legislation and the lifting of the restriction on female migration in the past. There are still a lot of challenges with safe migration, thus this project was quite relevant.

4.1.2 Key results contributing to the achievement of project objectives

The following are the most important contributions to the above-mentioned objectives among the various results accomplished by the CARE and WARBE-DF.

Overall Objectives	Achievements
To promote safe and planned migration particularly for women as a contribution to Sustainable Development Goals 5 and 8.	- In Bangladesh, civil society organisations affiliated with WARBE-DF worked closely with the government to explore shared issues

	<p>raised by the ILO Convention, CEDAW, GFMD, GCM, UN High-Level Dialogues, and UN Convention 1990.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - South Asian parliamentarians from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Nepal, and India formed the South Asian Parliamentary Caucus with the support of WARBE-DF, promising to raise migration concerns in national legislatures and to monitor SAARC, the Colombo Process, and the Abu Dhabi Dialogue talks and deliberations. - The GoB expressed that a unique institutional structure is needed to execute female migration rights at the Upazila level.
<p>Specific Objective: Outcome -1 Enhanced capacity of targeted Government institutions to develop gender responsive migration policy and procedures and to facilitate safe, orderly and gender sensitive migration for decent job placement of women workers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The severity of abuse and exploitation of migrant domestic and internal domestic workers was determined at a meeting on the International Labor Organization's (ILO) Convention C189, the Global Compact on Migration (GCM), and CEDAW. A technical analysis and assessment was conducted to determine whether the articles of C189 are feasible to implement, and the support service mechanism was improved. - Completed the safe migration information packages, learning materials (flip charts) for the courtyard meeting's content, crated and distributed the safe migration booklet and information board, and reviewed and completed the government training curriculum for addressing women and gender issues to be included in TTC training. - The BMET and TTCs have showed their intention to address women's and gender concerns through curriculum revision. - GoB officials showed an interest in implementing extensive training programmes for female migrants. - At the Upazila level, advocacy sessions for policy changes or upgrades for women who have been victims of migration were held.
<p>Specific Objective: Outcome 2</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A pre-decision orientation focused on Life Skills on safe migration, risk and vulnerabilities, women empowerment, rights

<p>Women in rural communities are empowered to make informed choices and decisions about migration and are able to access services</p>	<p>and legal support, and communication and training was organised.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Using UDCs and CBOs to bring services and information to women's doorsteps was seen as a technique for ensuring women's rights when moving. - The animated docu-movie was shown at all Project trainings in Keraniganj and Nawabganj, highlighting the critical issue of migration and middleman exploitation. - Information champions and UDC entrepreneurs referred 32 returnees and one prospective migrant to BMET, WARBE's grievance reception cell, and the government's financial help programme for returnee women migrants who returned to Bangladesh during the COVID-19 pandemic.
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

4.1.3. Coherence and Synergy

The Project interventions were determined to be compatible with other similar initiatives in the country during the end-of-project evaluation. The project aligns with the GoB's overarching migration agenda, which is expressed in the 8th five-year plan. It involves institutional and legislative change, institutional capacity building, skill development, access to services, rights and well-being protection, as well as digitalisation and private sector and stakeholder engagement. The project is also in line with the Government of Bangladesh's action plans for achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the National Skills Development Policy 2011.

Synergies were also formed with CSO advocacy and activities on safe female labour migration from Bangladesh and the preservation of women workers' rights both at home and abroad. WARBE-DF has effectively tapped into its network of South Asian parliamentarians and BOAF, a network of local non-governmental organizations.

4.1.4. Effectiveness of management

CARE/WARBE-DF is running the programme quite efficiently, despite the fact that the team is relatively small. The entire team's efforts and hard work have resulted in significant progress in all areas. With the start of the pandemic, management encountered difficulty in adjusting activities. WARBE-DF and CARE, on the other hand, used to communicate their work plans and discuss their strategic interventions on a regular basis during the COVID-19 era. To guarantee that the initiatives were delivered efficiently, WARBE used its lobbying network and civil society platforms. In the future, a framework should be developed to identify potential risks in the partners' implementation of projects, and action plans should be ready to implement in tough conditions.

4.2 Lessons Learned

The main lessons learned at programme level from the evaluation, based on facts, comments and observations made by the evaluators are the following:

1. Migration governance is complex and requires collaboration from all parties, including international organisations, national governments, and civil society organisations.
2. Collaboration with UDCs and CBOs is more significant than advocacy for delivering assistance to aspirant women migrants. It's not simple to find a balance between service delivery and advocacy.
3. Enabling venues for aspirant and migrant workers to socialise, such as women information champion, UDC and CBO is vital.
4. The adequate selection of qualified partner to implement a programme reflects in the achievements.
5. Even in the face of a politically unstable atmosphere or a COVID-19 breakout, programs can persist and fulfil their goals.
6. Large-scale initiatives have a long-term influence that is difficult to assess in the short term.

4.3 Recommendations

1. The CARE Safe Migration Project was abandoned 'prematurely' due to a lack of time to acquire long-term outcomes. Any future project that takes a holistic, rights-based, and outcomes-oriented approach should last at least five years in order to achieve long-term effects and observe social changes and transformations as a result of project interventions.
2. Discussions about the normative framework and protective measures should be centered on a specific issue and given greater time.
3. Residential training is more effective than non-residential training in terms of assuring trainee involvement and participation in the programme.
4. Despite having enormous potential in terms of providing information and other services to aspirational female migrants, women champions and UDCs have been left with no incentives to continue their work. This should be taken into account in future projects to ensure long-term success.
5. Family members of female migrants should be included in the project for better implementation. To address inclusion and cross-cutting issues, religious and educational institutions should be included in female migration-related programmes.
6. CSOs/NGOs should cooperate in synergy and coherence to minimise duplication of effort. Various groups' projects should not be concentrated in one region. They should reach out to as many migrant populations as possible, using comprehensive approaches that provide long-term, consistent results.
7. For consistent and high-quality results, projects like this require constant follow-up and monitoring. Before starting the project, make sure appropriate monitoring frameworks are in place for all outcomes and stakeholders.
8. To reach the point of sustainability and adequately demonstrable influence, the Project must obviously continue in some form. No 18-month programme may be successful unless it is accompanied with concurrent or follow-up programmes to continue or produce a compound positive result.
9. Returnee reintegration, skills training and reskilling for remigration, and entrepreneurship development for returnee women may all be included in future programs.

Annex: End-line Survey Results

Q1:How old are you?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
20-25	59	25.9	26.0	26.0
26-30	58	25.4	25.6	51.5
Valid 32-35	59	25.9	26.0	77.5
36-40	51	22.4	22.5	100.0
Total	227	99.6	100.0	
Missing System	1	.4		
Total	228	100.0		

Q5:How many members do you have in your family?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
2	12	5.3	5.3	5.3
3	30	13.2	13.2	18.4
Valid 4	99	43.4	43.4	61.8
5	50	21.9	21.9	83.8
More than 5	37	16.2	16.2	100.0
Total	228	100.0	100.0	

Q6:What is your marital Status?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Married	192	84.2	85.0	85.0
	Unmarried	17	7.5	7.5	92.5
	Divorcee	2	.9	.9	93.4
	Widow	12	5.3	5.3	98.7
	Any Other [Please Specify]	3	1.3	1.3	100.0
	Total	226	99.1	100.0	
Missing	System	2	.9		
	Total	228	100.0		

Q7:Which class have you attended?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Lower than Class Five.	65	28.5	28.6	28.6
	Up to Class Five	49	21.5	21.6	50.2
	From Class Six to Class Eight	59	25.9	26.0	76.2
	From Class Nine to Class Ten	41	18.0	18.1	94.3
	Higher Secondary	13	5.7	5.7	100.0
	Total	227	99.6	100.0	
Missing	System	1	.4		
	Total	228	100.0		

Q8:Type of your family:

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Nuclear Family	192	84.2	84.6	84.6
	Extended Family	35	15.4	15.4	100.0
	Total	227	99.6	100.0	
Missing	System	1	.4		
Total		228	100.0		

Q9:Are you the family head?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	80	35.1	35.4	35.4
	No	146	64.0	64.6	100.0
	Total	226	99.1	100.0	
Missing	System	2	.9		
Total		228	100.0		

Q10: If not, who is your family head?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Husband	117	51.3	76.0	76.0
Father	16	7.0	10.4	86.4
Mother	6	2.6	3.9	90.3
Children	7	3.1	4.5	94.8
Any other [Pease Specify	8	3.5	5.2	100.0
Total	154	67.5	100.0	
Missing System	74	32.5		
Total	228	100.0		

Q11:What type of relationship you have with family head? [Please select only one response]?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Not good	5	2.2	3.0	3.0
Somewhat good	21	9.2	12.8	15.9
Very Good	138	60.5	84.1	100.0
Total	164	71.9	100.0	
Missing System	64	28.1		
Total	228	100.0		

Q12:Do you make any decision at the household?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	169	74.1	74.8	74.8
	No	57	25.0	25.2	100.0
	Total	226	99.1	100.0	
Missing	System	2	.9		
Total		228	100.0		

Q14:If not, who makes them

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Husband	38	16.7	62.3	62.3
	Father	10	4.4	16.4	78.7
	Mother	4	1.8	6.6	85.2
	Children	5	2.2	8.2	93.4
	Any other [Pease Specify]	4	1.8	6.6	100.0
	Total	61	26.8	100.0	
Missing	System	167	73.2		
Total		228	100.0		

Q15:What type of relationship you have with the person in your family who makes the decisions? [Please select only one response]

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Not good	3	1.3	3.2
	Somewhat good	13	5.7	17.2
	Very good	77	33.8	100.0
	Total	93	40.8	100.0
Missing	System	135	59.2	
Total		228	100.0	

Q16:Total migration years (for returnees only):

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Less than one year.	2	.9	10.0
	More than one year, but less than two years	6	2.6	40.0
	More than two years, but less than three years	4	1.8	60.0
	More than three years, but less than four years	3	1.3	75.0
	More than four years, but less than five years	2	.9	85.0
	More than five years	3	1.3	100.0
Total		20	8.8	100.0

Missing	System	208	91.2	
Total		228	100.0	

Q19:Do you know about the basic rights of women and migrant workers?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Yes	190	83.3	83.3	83.3
Valid No	38	16.7	16.7	100.0
Total	228	100.0	100.0	

Q20:From where did you get these ideas?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Women Champions	3	1.3	1.4	1.4
Valid WARBE	177	77.6	80.1	81.4
Valid GoB Training	6	2.6	2.7	84.2
Valid Relatives	2	.9	.9	85.1
Valid Neighbours	1	.4	.5	85.5
Valid Other Sources	2	.9	.9	86.4
Valid Women Champions and Neighbours	1	.4	.5	86.9
Valid WARBE and GoB training	1	.4	.5	87.3
Valid WARBE and Neighbours	8	3.5	3.6	91.0

	WARBE and other sources	9	3.9	4.1	95.0
	Women champions and others	3	1.3	1.4	96.4
	WARBE and Relatives	1	.4	.5	96.8
	WARBE, Neighbours and Others	2	.9	.9	97.7
	WARBE, Neighbours, Relatives and others	4	1.8	1.8	99.5
	Women Champions, WARBE, Relatives, Neighbours, and others	1	.4	.5	100.0
	Total	221	96.9	100.0	
Missing	System	7	3.1		
Total		228	100.0		

Q21:Have you participated in any training/Courtyard Meetings/Video Screening organized by WARBE?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	202	88.6	95.7
	No	9	3.9	100.0
	Total	211	92.5	100.0
Missing	System	17	7.5	
Total		228	100.0	

Q22:If yes, then what type of activity have you participated in?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Training	62	27.2	28.3	28.3
	Courtyard Meeting (CM)	15	6.6	6.8	35.2
	Video Screening (VS)	8	3.5	3.7	38.8
	Training and CM	11	4.8	5.0	43.8
	Training and VS	41	18.0	18.7	62.6
	CM and VS	24	10.5	11.0	73.5
	Training, CM and VS	58	25.4	26.5	100.0
	Total	219	96.1	100.0	
Missing	System	9	3.9		
Total		228	100.0		

Q23:Do you think, the events organised by WARBE (training/courtyard meeting/video screening) were beneficial for you?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	210	92.1	97.2	97.2
	No	6	2.6	2.8	100.0
	Total	216	94.7	100.0	
Missing	System	12	5.3		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24B:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Leadership	45	19.7	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	183	80.3		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24C: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

Stress and Time Management		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	No	179	78.5	84.0	84.0
Valid	Yes	34	14.9	16.0	100.0
	Total	213	93.4	100.0	
Missing	System	15	6.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24D: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

Problem solving and decision making		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	No	119	52.2	55.9	55.9
Valid	Yes	94	41.2	44.1	100.0
	Total	213	93.4	100.0	
Missing	System	15	6.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24E: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

Communication & Negotiation		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	No	170	74.6	79.8	79.8
Valid	Yes	43	18.9	20.2	100.0
	Total	213	93.4	100.0	
Missing	System	15	6.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24F: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Savings and Investment	102	44.7	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	126	55.3		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24G: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Personal security and safety	106	46.5	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	122	53.5		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24H:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Professional excellence, confidence and management	35	15.4	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	193	84.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24I:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Sexual harassment abuses and exploitation	103	45.2	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	125	54.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24J:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Legal support	60	26.3	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	168	73.7		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24K:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Decision making to migrate	97	42.5	100.0	100.0
Missing System	131	57.5		
Total	228	100.0		

Q24L:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Knowledge on migration: Information on countries of destinations, Cost-benefit analysis, economic and social costs.	147	64.5	100.0	100.0
Missing System	81	35.5		
Total	228	100.0		

Q24M:What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Migration Information and Services by different government & non-government bodies	52	22.8	100.0	100.0
Missing System	176	77.2		
Total	228	100.0		

Q24N: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Financial literacy and Remittance Management	70	30.7	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	158	69.3		
Total		228	100.0		

Q24O: What life skills and soft skills did you learn from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Other: Please specify _____	4	1.8	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	224	98.2		
Total		228	100.0		

Q25: Was there enough material for the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	189	82.9	85.9	85.9
Valid	No	31	13.6	14.1	100.0
	Total	220	96.5	100.0	
Missing	System	8	3.5		
Total		228	100.0		

Q26:Have you been able to apply the knowledge / skills gathered from training in your life?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	169	74.1	77.9	77.9
	No	48	21.1	22.1	100.0
	Total	217	95.2	100.0	
Missing	System	11	4.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q27:Do you think, it would be good if you could get some more information / skills from the training?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	215	94.3	96.8	96.8
	No	7	3.1	3.2	100.0
	Total	222	97.4	100.0	
Missing	System	6	2.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q28:How many training sessions/workshops have you attended up to today?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	None	3	1.3	1.3	1.3
	Less than or equal to 2	178	78.1	79.8	81.2
	3 to 4	37	16.2	16.6	97.8

	5 or above	5	2.2	2.2	100.0
	Total	223	97.8	100.0	
Missing	System	5	2.2		
Total		228	100.0		

Q29:How important was the training to your personal life? Would you say that the training was [select only one response] to your personal life?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Somewhat important	51	22.4	23.0
	Very important	171	75.0	100.0
	Total	222	97.4	100.0
Missing	System	6	2.6	
Total		228	100.0	

Q30:If you answered that the training/workshop was not important or somewhat important to your personal life, why did you give that answer? [Only 13 respondents answer this question]

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	The training material was repetitious	2	.9	15.4
	Training sessions were too long	3	1.3	23.1
	The venues were unsuitable	1	.4	7.7
	Other: Please Specify	4	1.8	30.8
	23	1	.4	7.7
	27	2	.9	15.4
				100.0

Total		13	5.7	100.0
Missing	System	215	94.3	
Total		228	100.0	

Q32:Please provide a specific example of the way you solved a real-life problem by applying the knowledge learned during the training

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	193	84.6	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	35	15.4		
Total		228	100.0		

Q33:How could trainings be further improved?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	189	82.9	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	39	17.1		
Total		228	100.0		

Q34:Have you seen any video animation by CARE/WARBE?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	188	82.5	83.9	83.9
	No	36	15.8	16.1	100.0

Total	224	98.2	100.0
Missing System	4	1.8	
Total	228	100.0	

Q36:In your opinion how effective were this video animation to understand above issues?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Very ineffective	1	.4	.5	.5
Valid Neither effective nor ineffective	2	.9	1.1	1.6
Valid Somewhat effective	74	32.5	40.7	42.3
Valid Very effective	105	46.1	57.7	100.0
Valid Total	182	79.8	100.0	
Missing System	46	20.2		
Total	228	100.0		

Q37:How many courtyard meetings have you attended up to today?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid None	20	8.8	9.5	9.5
Valid Less than or equal to 2	167	73.2	79.1	88.6
Valid 3 to 4	22	9.6	10.4	99.1
Valid 5 or above	2	.9	.9	100.0
Valid Total	211	92.5	100.0	

Missing	System	17	7.5	
Total		228	100.0	

Q38:To what degree has awareness /training of safe migration and life skills improved? Would you say that your awareness about this issues has [select only one response]

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Not improved at all	1	.4	.5
	Improved a little	7	3.1	3.7
	Slightly improved	62	27.2	28.8
	Fairly improved	87	38.2	40.5
	Greatly improved	58	25.4	27.0
	Total	215	94.3	100.0
Missing	System	13	5.7	
Total		228	100.0	

Q39:Do you know of any migration services available in your community?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	119	52.2	53.6
	No	103	45.2	46.4
	Total	222	97.4	100.0
Missing	System	6	2.6	
Total		228	100.0	

Q40A:If yes, from where? (Each option is answered by 228 respondents)

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid CBO	6	2.6	100.0	100.0
Valid WARBE	105	46.1	100.0	100.0
Other NGOs	5	2.2	2.2	100.0
GoB	26	11.4	11.4	100.0

Q41:Have you ever taken these services?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Women Champions	94	41.2	85.5	85.5
Valid WARBE	16	7.0	14.5	100.0
Total	110	48.2	100.0	
Missing System	118	51.8		
Total	228	100.0		

Q47:Did you take any service from UDCs?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Yes	28	12.3	16.8	16.8
Valid No	139	61.0	83.2	100.0
Total	167	73.2	100.0	

Missing	System	61	26.8	
Total		228	100.0	

Q44:If yes, who provide these services?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	WARBE	80	35.1	85.1	85.1
	Other NGOs	2	.9	2.1	87.2
	GoB	3	1.3	3.2	90.4
	23	1	.4	1.1	91.5
Valid	24	5	2.2	5.3	96.8
	123	1	.4	1.1	97.9
	234	1	.4	1.1	98.9
	1234	1	.4	1.1	100.0
	Total	94	41.2	100.0	
Missing	System	134	58.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q45:Do you know about Union Digital Centers (UDCs)- Migration Information Corner?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	85	37.3	38.5	38.5
Valid	No	136	59.6	61.5	100.0
	Total	221	96.9	100.0	
Missing	System	7	3.1		

Total	228	100.0		
-------	-----	-------	--	--

Q49:How satisfied are you with the services you received?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neither satisfied nor dissatisfied	1	.4	3.2	3.2
	Somewhat satisfied	10	4.4	32.3	35.5
	Very satisfied	20	8.8	64.5	100.0
Total		31	13.6	100.0	
Missing	System	197	86.4		
Total		228	100.0		

Q50:What are the major challenges experienced by receiving services?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	27	11.8	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	201	88.2		
Total		228	100.0		

Q51:Any recommendation/suggestions for improving services?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	25	11.0	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	203	89.0		

Total	228	100.0		
-------	-----	-------	--	--

Q52:What comes to your mind while talking about 'safe migration'?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Qualtitative answer	204	89.5	100.0	100.0
Missing System	24	10.5		
Total	228	100.0		

Q55:Have you received any information on health related risks associated with migration (life skill)?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Yes	170	74.6	78.3	78.3
Valid No	47	20.6	21.7	100.0
Valid Total	217	95.2	100.0	
Missing System	11	4.8		
Total	228	100.0		

Q56:How useful were the information for your migration?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Not Useful	3	1.3	1.8	1.8
Valid Somewhat Useful	66	28.9	40.0	41.8
Valid Very useful	96	42.1	58.2	100.0

Total		165	72.4	100.0
Missing	System	63	27.6	
Total		228	100.0	

Q57:Did you face any fraudulence in migration?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	10	4.4	4.9	4.9
Valid	No	194	85.1	95.1	100.0
	Total	204	89.5	100.0	
Missing	System	24	10.5		
Total		228	100.0		

Q58:From whom did you face exploitation / fraudulence?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Dalal	5	2.2	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	223	97.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q59:What type of exploitation / fraudulence did you face?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent

	Misappropriation of Money	3	1.3	50.0	50.0
	Other	1	.4	16.7	66.7
Valid	12	1	.4	16.7	83.3
	14	1	.4	16.7	100.0
	Total	6	2.6	100.0	
Missing	System	222	97.4		
Total		228	100.0		

Q60: Is the fraud Dalal from within your community?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	3	1.3	60.0	60.0
Valid	No	2	.9	40.0	100.0
	Total	5	2.2	100.0	
Missing	System	223	97.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q61: If yes, did you seek redress against this Dalal at the community level?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	3	1.3	75.0	75.0
Valid	No	1	.4	25.0	100.0
	Total	4	1.8	100.0	
Missing	System	224	98.2		

Total	228	100.0		
-------	-----	-------	--	--

Q62:If yes, did it work/help? Will it work/help?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Yes	1	.4	33.3	33.3
	No	2	.9	66.7	100.0
	Total	3	1.3	100.0	
Missing	System	225	98.7		
Total		228	100.0		

Q63:If not, why?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	1	.4	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	227	99.6		
Total		228	100.0		

Q64:Does WARBE or the CBO has any role in helping you to file claim or complain against the fraudulence?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	4	1.8	33.3	33.3
Valid	No	8	3.5	66.7	100.0
	Total	12	5.3	100.0	
Missing	System	216	94.7		
Total		228	100.0		

Q65:If yes, describe in details

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Qualitative answer	5	2.2	100.0	100.0
Missing	System	223	97.8		
Total		228	100.0		

Q66:If not, do you think this (legal aid, mediation, arbitration) should come under the purview of their work in future?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	Yes	8	3.5	66.7	66.7
Valid	No	4	1.8	33.3	100.0
	Total	12	5.3	100.0	
Missing	System	216	94.7		
Total		228	100.0		

Q67:Do you think the work you are doing with/benefits you are receiving from WARBE can be continued in some form at the community level by initiative of the community or CBO even f the NGO/CSO – WARBE and CARE does not continue to work on this project?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Yes	172	75.4	96.1	96.1
Valid No	7	3.1	3.9	100.0
Total	179	78.5	100.0	
Missing System	49	21.5		
Total	228	100.0		

Q68: If yes, please explain how do you think that is possible?

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Qualitative answer	77	33.8	33.8	33.8
Total	151	66.2	66.2	100.0
Total	228	100.0	100.0	

Q69:If no, please explain why

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Qualitative answer	7	3.1	100.0	100.0
Missing System	221	96.9		
Total	228	100.0		